Stakeholder Views for a Sustainable Future

A distillation of views from different major groups across the globe on the possible outcomes of the World Summit on Sustainable Development.

Prepared by Stakeholder Forum for Our Common Future, as a contribution to the Second Preparatory Committee meeting of the World Summit on Sustainable Development, the First Substantive Session for the Summit.

January 2002
Contents

Key message 3 - 7
Introduction 8
2. Poverty Eradication, Human Security and Human Development 12 - 15
3. Globalisation: Setting Trade and Investment Towards Sustainability 16 - 18
4. Sustainable Production and Consumption 19 – 22
5. Natural Resources: Integrated Management and Regulation 23 - 32
6. Health and Environment 33 - 34
7. Finance for Sustainable Development 35 - 37
8. Technology Transfer, Capacity Building and Education 38 - 40
9. Governance and Participation 41 - 45
10. Global Deal 46
References 47
Stakeholders throughout the world are helping in many different ways to make the incremental transition towards a more sustainable society. Several groups have made significant progress on sustainable development over the past ten years in their own activities both on the ground and at national and international levels. However, all groups recognise that there is much more to be done and most want to help achieve further progress. Many Stakeholders are now actively preparing to play a major part in the World Summit for Sustainable Development (Earth Summit 2002) and the activities that come out of it. Stakeholders have been actively engaged in the regional preparatory processes, and representatives of the nine major groups have recently prepared global syntheses on behalf of their groups as an input to the second Preparatory Committee for the WSSD in New York in January.

In this paper Stakeholder Forum for Our Common Future (formerly UNED Forum) has pulled together some key recommendations from the different stakeholder submissions as a contribution to the debate on options to be addressed at the Summit and beyond. Many of the findings from the review of progress since Rio is common to all the stakeholders, and indeed to the UN Secretary General’s report. This paper does not repeat that analysis. Rather it concentrates on those recommendations for action that are emerging from the various stakeholder inputs.

This first section presents various views of ten themes central to the whole debate, coming out of different stakeholder meetings. Stakeholders are expecting to concentrate much of their efforts on these topics and looking to governments to establish a dynamic framework for achieving these issues, in participation with the whole stakeholder community. In the second section is a more indepth collation of the principle recommendations and proposals coming out of the various stakeholder statements and expert roundtable meetings that have fed into the Summit process. The entire document is a work-in-progress, as the dialogue develops and new groups come forward to present their views.

1. **Principles, Vision and Strategy.** All stakeholders subscribe to the vital importance of the concept of sustainable development as a guide to how the world should evolve. In this context there is continuing support for the 1992 Rio Declaration on Environment and Development. However, many would like to see further operationalisation of the principles contained in Agenda 21, including the precautionary, subsidiarity and polluter pays principles. These should provide the foundation from which all activities and policies that come out of Johannesburg.

Secondly, the vision for Sustainable development needs to be much more clearly communicated and understood. A number of groups have utilised the Earth Charter as a document which clearly depicts the vision of sustainable development in a powerful and eloquent way. The Charter could be used to build greater awareness and stronger support for sustainable development across the globe. The first substantive Prep Com for the Summit (Prep Com 2) could initiate a discussion, between governments and all parts of society, about how best to use the Charter to build a stronger and shared sense of the vision and goal of sustainability.

Sustainable development involves a very wide field of needs, actions and policies which relate to many different stakeholders, as well as governments. In order to work out all its implications and establish priorities, it is necessary to establish wide-ranging sustainable development strategies. These strategies should cut across international, regional, national and local levels and include a variety of different stakeholders in their development, implementation, monitoring and review. Some countries have established effective national strategies for sustainable development (NSSDs) and bodies since Rio, this should be assisted through greater support and funding for initiatives like the UNDP’s Capacity 21 Programme. Also the linkages between NSSDs and Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers of the World Bank need to be made more explicit. Similarly many local government authorities around the world have developed local agenda 21s. Some local authorities, businesses, trade unions, women, youth, farmers, indigenous peoples, scientific community, NGOs and other stakeholder groups have also been active in trying to turn sustainable development into an operational process. However, Sustainable development now needs to be built more systematically into the governance structures and objectives of national and local government and of other organisations, such as through the establishment of local, and national Councils on Sustainable Development. Earth Summit 2002 (WSSD) could usefully establish a stronger framework and guidance for countries, local government and other stakeholders on how to establish and monitor progress on such strategies. Regional strategies and councils should also be established, to create the appropriate intermediate machinery.
for coordinating sustainable development at the regional level. The next five years will be an important time for developing more regionally-based implementation, regulation, monitoring, coordination and assessment of progress. It will be particularly important to establish appropriate machinery for the advancement of sustainable development in Africa where many of the problems are most acute.

2. Poverty Eradication, Human Security and Human Development
Sustainable Development is not just an environmental demand it is a developmental necessity. The Millennium Summit reaffirmed and restated international commitment to agreed development goals for 2015. However it was not specific about how to meet these targets and measures that have been agreed at the Millennium Summit and previously, particularly regarding the central goal of alleviating poverty. There is general agreement that more vigorous action in this area is the largest single challenge within the sustainable development debate, and key to building a new North-South partnership for sustainable development at the Johannesburg Summit. Stakeholders see the Summit as a vital step to build concrete programmes for action and partnership to tackle poverty, by focusing on some of the specific target areas. These include water and sanitation, health (including, environmental health and HIV/AIDS), employment creation and improving working conditions, food security and energy (particularly renewable and sustainable energy). The Second Prep Com should establish which bodies will take the lead in developing, coordinating and monitoring such programmes, as well as identify how new and additional resources can be mobilised for their implementation. The Summit could then add intermediate goals to be reached in 5 and 10 years, as well as by 2015 and 2020, so as to add greater urgency, planning and impetus to the programmes to be established.

3. Globalisation: Setting Trade and Investment to Sustainability
Now that Doha is in the process of launching a new trade round, the key issue for sustainability will be to ensure that the round delivers on the legitimate aspirations of developing countries for better market access to the developed world, and for the elimination of distorting and environmentally perverse subsidies, as well as other distorting market practices in the North. The trade round also needs to provide for greater coherence and support for the Multilateral Environment Agreements, ILO core labour conventions and Human Rights Principles, as well as other international obligations, establishing mechanisms to put these obligations at the core of the trade agenda. This would include the adoption of Sustainability Impact Assessments prior to the negotiation of trade agreements and well as after their implementation. The Johannesburg Summit could be used to send a clear message and framework for the trade and investment community to more effectively address these issues.

Investment is one of the major engines for change in the world, and the types of investment are critical in shaping whether development will be sustainable or not. It would be useful to develop an agreed international framework to guide or regulate the basis on which investment is undertaken, particularly foreign investment so as to ensure that it does support sustainability goals, including socially responsible, ethical and environmentally sound investment. Such agreements could build on the guidelines and standards already emerging from international environment, labour and human rights legislation. The Summit could be used to launch an international process to create such a framework for enhancing the quality of investment.

4. Sustainable Production and Consumption
Global markets need to make the shift towards more sustainable and efficient frameworks. This will include enabling and increasing corporate responsibility, such as through introducing eco-taxes, adoption of ISO 14000 and other integrated management approaches including on occupation health and safety, the use of environmental and social accounting, and sustainability reporting. It will also be vital to stimulate public debate and awareness, as well as to engage a more informed consumer and producer position e.g. through product labelling, independent product verification, publicity campaigns, technical training and capacity building in sustainable production methods, investment in the research and development of sustainable alternatives. The Second Prep Com offers an opportunity to initiate a debate to develop a process for enhancing such activities. This process should be met more substantially with international commitment and the development of a clear strategy at the Johannesburg Summit.

5. Natural Resources: Integrated Management and Regulation
Governments, regional bodies and international institutions need make progress on taking an integrated and ecosystems approach to natural resource management and regulation. This will include ensuring greater coordination between different environmental areas, e.g. Climate and Oceans, but also coordination with institutions that impact the environment, including development and economic bodies. Funds and resources (human, technical and information) for local, regional and international environmental issues need to be significantly enhanced e.g. increased finance for UEP and the Global Environment Facility. The adoption of the polluter pays principle, should be used to raise further funds e.g. through eco-
taxes which can be ring fenced for mitigating polluting impacts and developing environmentally sound alternatives. Similarly, in accordance with the subsidiarity principle, broad stakeholder participation, community-based and local level activities should be further endorsed and supported by multilateral and national bodies, to build on-the-ground implementation or integrated natural resources programmes.

International and regional environmental regulations need to be further implemented and enforced at the national level. The Summit should be the occasion for the ratification and entry into force of the Kyoto Protocol (and its associated measures and instruments), the Biosafety Protocol, and further steps on implementing the Conventions on POPs and PICs, Hazardous Wastes and Chemicals, Desertification, and Straddling fish stocks, amongst other agreements. Implementation, resources and enforcement machinery for MEAs need to be strengthened. These agreements also need to be integrated more effectively along ecosystem-based frameworks. This could occur through establishing thematic groupings, e.g. chemicals, atmosphere and biodiversity, to encourage greater in-tie in between conventions. The integration of the environmental, economic and social aspects of sustainable development in a new broad legal framework might be pursued as a new initiative. This would include developing frameworks to establish greater clarity between MEAs and other agreements, such as ILO conventions on workbased approaches, Human Rights and global economic agreements.

6. Health and Environment
Critical issues related to health and environment, include the need to provide access to an adequate quality and quantity of water supply and sanitation, sustainable and affordable energy, basic health care and family planning services (medications, education and training, clinics and hospitals), provision of essential food requirements, adoption and implementation of occupational health standards in order to tackle major chronic and acute global health problems e.g. HIV/AIDS, Malaria, Tuberculosis, waterborne diseases. Further national and international commitment to address these issues needs to be made at the Summit.

Actions include the clarification of trade law in relation to intellectual property rights as compared to the production of essential generic medicines. Also indigenous and traditional knowledge of biological resources with medicinal potential need to be legally and financially acknowledged and respected. The precautionary principle should be further applied in the development and use of biotechnology, e.g. for new medicines and food crops.

Many are calling for a more rights-based approach to the provision of basic needs essential for ensuring sustained healthy populations, especially to target those most critically in need, including poor and rural communities, women, workers, youth, elderly and disabled. Additional regional and global funds and resources will be required to meet this huge need, including establishing clear entitlements for the poor, e.g. to credit, land tenure, IPR, and this should initiated by bringing new and additional financial commitments to the Summit.

7. Finance for Sustainable Development.
There should be specific discussions about how the decline in Official Development Assistance can be reversed, and put back on a steady path of growth, towards meeting the 0.7% GNP target, as well as ensuring the untying of aid from donor country trade and industry objectives. Also there needs to be debate on how debt relief and debt cancellation can be extended, as well the use of Special Drawing Rights.

There needs to be a specific negotiation during 2002 seeking a substantial replenishment of the Global Environment Facility and an extension of its scope. Additional finances (to ODA) need to be made for the provision of Global Public Goods (GPG) e.g. eradication of global diseases, climate enhancement, conservation of biological diversity. These will need to be clearly defined, as well as the mechanisms for their provision, perhaps through the establishment of an intergovernmental task force on GPGs with stakeholder involvement. Other key areas, such as the redirection of national military expenditure towards sustainable development aims, need to be openly debated. The Summit should also be an opportunity to review and establish new financial mechanisms e.g. exchange rate and currency transfer taxes, that may be addressed at the UN Financing for Development process as well as elsewhere, and to assess their relevance to the Johannesburg Summit in mobilising finances for sustainable development.

8. Technology Transfer, Capacity Building and Education
These are key resources in mobilising implementation of sustainable development. In applying the principles of partnership and “Common and Differentiated Responsibility”, significant international, regional and bilateral steps need to be made to increase the adoption of environmentally sound, ethical, affordable and socially responsible technologies and practices. The second Prep Com should begin to establish strategies and programmes for enhancing exchange of tech-
nologies and capacity building on the key sectoral issues being addressed at the Summit, including enhancing the role of and financial support for UNDP’s Capacity 21 initiative. Stakeholders, as well as governments and multi-lateral institutions, can also play key roles in this process, as many NGOs and CBOs, local authorities, indigenous peoples, faith communities, trade unions and private corporations have experiences of best practice that could be learnt from and adapted to be applied elsewhere. Global multi-stakeholder networks along sectoral lines could be established at the Summit, to enhance this process. The role of Information and Communications Technology will clearly have a part to play, the activities of NetAid and related capacity building programmes need to be further supported towards establishing greater ICT infrastructure and use at national and local levels. Furthermore, the Summit should give international endorsement of sustainable development to be set at the core of education from primary to tertiary levels, cutting across disciplines and research, as well as informal means of learning e.g. adult education and workplace training. This will require additional commitment of resources to train the teachers and trainers in this approach to learning. It will also require assessment of the impact to social, employment, environmental and economics areas from technology transfer and capacity building.

9. Governance and participation. Cutting across the three pillars of sustainable development, many groups continue to note the imbalance of governance away from the environmental and social pillars. These include:

Environmental Frameworks: As such there are calls for UNEP to be given agency status. Its resource base should be assured and strengthened. The political weight of UNEP within the UN would be increased, further assisting its role in coordinating UN agencies that work on environmental areas, under the auspices of the UN Environment Management Group. National reporting requirements would also be increased. It should be given stronger regional capacity and resources for its regional offices, enabling a more balanced interaction with the Regional Economic Commission. It needs to be given a specific role and mandate in order to better promote and coordinate the clustering of MEA’s secretariats.

Development and Economic Frameworks: Current reforms in the area of economic institutions, such as the WTO, World Bank, IMF and other multilateral economic and development institutions, should aim to ensure that they set their overarching goal toward a global economic architecture that supports balanced and equitable sustainable development. It should include the strengthening of the role of stakeholders, e.g. through establishing rules of major group accreditation as exists in UN ECOSOC. The Summit should also address the possibility of a strengthened economic body within the UN, to draw these institutions within a more integrated governance framework.

Sustainable Development frameworks: The UN Commission on Sustainable Development (CSD) should be strengthened to fully establish its overarching and integral relationship to other UN agencies and commissions, external institutions. The mechanisms and processes to do this need to be clarified. The involvement of stakeholders needs to be further enhanced within CSD dialogues and outcomes. Also the CSD Intersessional need to become much more pro-active. One possibility would be to move the Multi-Stakeholder Dialogues to the beginning of the Intersessionals and to receive input from the regions on the issues topics of that given year. This would require the Regional Economic Commissions to be much more active in the process. During the second week of the Intersessionals, governments would then make presentations with a global focus. The Chair would produce a draft drawing from the stakeholder dialogue, the regional input, IACSD and the global discussion. The draft would be published on the last day for governments to take back to their capitals for review and report back the following year. The Second Prep Com should address the possibility of the adaptation of the Regional Economic Commissions to become Regional Commissions for Sustainable Development, including multi-stakeholder involvement. National governments should be encouraged and support bringing in wider ministerial representation to CSD sessions (beyond environment ministers), with ministerial representation defined according to the issues being address at a particular CSD session, to ensure that decisions coming out of the process are more likely to reflect a cross departmental view within separate governments.

Participation: Stakeholders are very active in promoting sustainable development. They stand ready to join in partnerships of all kinds to help expand the contributions they can make. As the Secretary General’s Report puts it:

"While these successes are important, there are several shortcomings. The participation of women at all levels is still relatively low, and participation at the international level is not adequately geographically balanced and not adequately financed. As a result, the majority of the voices that are heard are those who can afford to participate and have ready access to the process. At the national level, few countries provide incentives to non-governmental actors to participate, limiting their contributions to the national process."
An often-observed shortcoming, particularly at the national and international levels, is that stakeholder participation is rarely allowed in actual decision-making. Moreover, participation at these levels is often based on temporary and ad hoc rather than permanent and reliable mechanisms and procedures. A strengthened sense of ownership of the decisions taken among participating stakeholders would help in implementing many decisions relating to sustainable development.

The Summit should seek to strengthen and consolidate the process for engaging a wide range of stakeholders in debate and action relating to sustainable development. Stakeholders have grown in authority, capacity and responsibility since Rio. Their participation is not simply a token gesture but is essential for ensuring progress on implementation. They can contribute to Sustainable Development through bringing expert and local knowledge on key issues, experiences of best practice from on the ground implementation, local and community-based programmes, independent assessment and peer review of programmes. These multi-stakeholder activities should be linked to more substantive roles for the further implementation of Agenda 21. These roles should be recognised by and established in partnership with governments.

Stakeholders will be bringing their own reviews of action and proposals for the future to the Johannesburg Summit. Stakeholder Forum is seeking to encourage the further development of joint stakeholder action through the Implementation Conference, which is to be held just before the Summit. The Summit could be made the occasion for giving full recognition of this vital stakeholder activity.

More broadly stakeholders need to be fully involved in all aspects of developing and implementing sustainability strategies and programmes at regional, national and local levels. Frameworks for achieving this, such as the Aarhus Convention, could be further developed and supported at national, regional and global levels.

10. Global Deal

At Johannesburg heads of state and high-level ministers will need to set out a strong statement of global commitment, endorsing the key steps that will help make the shift towards Sustainable Development. Many groups positively referred to the development of a Global Deal, but called for an inclusive process to clarify government and stakeholder roles, as well as establishing its broad remit and goals. The NGO Dialogue Paper for Prep Comm 2 outlines some key principles that should underlie a new Global Deal for sustainable development. They said that "The notion of the WSSD producing a new “Global Deal” was considered by the UNECE NGO consultation as a result of suggestions made previously by the South African and Danish governments, among others. Its objective would be to bridge North/South differences on key elements, including:

- **Equity** – eradicating poverty through equitable and sustainable access to resources;
- **Rights** – securing environmental and social rights;
- **Limits** – reducing resource use to within sustainable limits;
- **Justice** – recognition of ecological and social debts and cancellation of financial debts;
- **Democracy** – ensuring access to information and public participation; and
- **Ethics** – rethinking the values and principles that guide human behaviour."

The full version of this document can be obtained online at: http://www.earthsummit2002.org
Introduction

The review of progress in Agenda 21, presented at the numerous meetings that have run up to the Earth Summit 2002, makes for depressing but provocative reading. The problems we currently face are a long list of urgent crises and more chronic on-going environmental, economic, socio-cultural and political pressures. Whilst these problems are not likely to go away without clear and targeted action, the most difficult issue to face is that whilst many of the solutions are already known there are more fundamental underlying factors that have blocked further progress. These problems include:

- Political inaction and lack of responsibility;
- Failure to implement financial and legal commitments;
- An inability to think and act in an integrated way;
- A failure to deal with institutional corruption and excessive bureaucracy;
- Poor engagement of the public and civil society;
- Failure to integrate activities across all levels and sectors

In this paper Stakeholder Forum for Our Common Future has pulled together some key recommendations to address these problems, arising from the different stakeholder submissions to contribute to the debate on options to be addressed at the preparations, the Summit and beyond. The discussion focuses on the proposals raised during civil society meetings across the globe, that have tried to address how to tackle these more fundamental barriers to sustainability. Much of the findings from the review of progress since Rio are common to all the stakeholders, and indeed to the UN Secretary General's report. This paper does not repeat that analysis. Rather it concentrates on those recommendations for action that are emerging from the various stakeholder inputs.

It should be noted that to further assist the comparison between processes a short summary of the outcomes of the regional government meetings are also included in brackets [ ] above the stakeholder proposals.
1. Principles, Vision and Strategy: Towards Social, Economic and Environmental Justice

At the Regional Summit preparatory meetings governments generally felt that it was necessary to pay special emphasis on the implementation of, polluter-pays principle, precautionary principle and the principle of “common but differentiated responsibilities” (1). Governments particularly agreed to promote the application of the polluter-pays principle, as set forth in the Rio Declaration, underlying a number of relevant multilateral agreements, in decision-making for sustainable development (2).

Echoing what governments had already touched upon, participants in the stakeholder meetings also called for governments to reaffirm their commitments to a global partnership based on “common but differentiated responsibilities”, to work together to transform unsustainable consumption and production, and implement the polluter-pays principle, precautionary principle, as well as better integrate ecological, economic and social dimensions (7). They called for the substantive implementation and integration of Rio principles in domestic and international laws. Specific civil society recommendations focused on four Rio principles, as follows.

1.1 Participation and subsidiarity

For different stakeholders to be effective in promoting sustainable livelihoods, Civil society must have the rights and political opportunity to interact with Governments and participate meaningfully in decision-making processes. Enabling a stronger role in participation and management from civil society at all levels will help increase Ownership, Co-management, Decision-making, Implementing actors, Communities driving progress, implementation of Legal and other formal frameworks (7, 10). This will require:

- **Capacity building** to support informed decision-making. Activities include the provision of social services, e.g. health care, public information, greater access and use of information technology, to enable the participation of multiple stakeholders in sustainable development, independent media, policy development and implementation (10, 12).
- **Training a greater number and diversity of people** so they are equipped with the skills to facilitate a process of thorough integration and decentralisation (10).
- **Further decentralisation of decision-making** is required in all areas (7).
- **Increased two-way information flow**, including to and from local level, to monitor emerging issues and assess progress (10).
- **Establish institutions and participative mechanisms at all levels** to actively and legally involve all stakeholders across sectors in decision-making processes. Key Processes, such as the development of legislation and policy frameworks, should require Multi-Stakeholder Participation (10, 13). Governments should set up clear bodies to develop coherent strategies and monitor, progress. Including the establishment of:
  - Local, national and regional Councils for Sustainable Development, to compliment the role of the UN Commission on Sustainable Development,
  - Solid frameworks, criteria and standards for multi-stakeholder participation within the councils, at all levels, to be developed in an open and inclusive manner.
- **To undertake assessment and sharing of experiences** of the potential costs and benefits of multi-stakeholder processes, as well as identifying means of creating an equal playing field for MSPs (7, 14)
- **Enhanced rights for marginalized people, through establishment and implementation of legal frameworks and the national level**, particularly for women, workers, poor, indigenous peoples, migrant and local communities, including their rights to:
  - Self-determination;
  - Access, ownership and management of natural resources;
  - Access, ownership and management of information;
  - Access to justice and recognition of customary law;
  - Free, prior and informed consent before development projects and plans;
  - Control and share in the use of traditional knowledge and intellectual property;
  - Define own development;
1.2 Polluter Pays – a portfolio of policy tools

A range of different policy tools should be adopted to implement the polluter pays principle. A more traditional option is:

- **Full cost accounting** of environmentally damaging activities, to be applied both public and private arenas through incorporation of environmental activities into taxation, as well as public and private budgets and accounts.

It should be recognised however that not all environmental values can be assessed from a monetary perspective Therefore it is important to develop and utilise alternative mechanisms to encourage people to “internalise” to the costs of environmental activities, through adopting an environmentally sound, ecosystems approaches, such as:

- **Integrated management systems** in private and public institutions e.g. ISO 14000, “BACTNEEC” (Best Available Technology Not entailing Excessive Cost), ILO Occupational Health and Safety Guidelines [7, 33].
- **Integrated ecosystems management** in public planning and decision-making at national and regional levels e.g. Integrated Coastal Zone Management, Integrated Water Resource Management, Multi-Criteria Analyses [7, 31].

1.3 Precautionary approach – from principle to practice

The Precautionary Principle should be applied throughout policy-making, productive and consumptive processes e.g. food, manufacture, energy, trade and investment, water supply and sanitation. This includes:

- **Using incentives and dis-incentives to prevent unsustainable activities**, e.g. the removal and environmentally perverse subsidies and imposition of a package of tools e.g. eco-taxes, tradable permits and certification schemes.
- **Greater preparedness in the face of uncertainty**, through increased research, early warning analysis and assessments of risk e.g. Product Life Cycle Assessments, Environmental Impact Assessments [7]
- **Risk prevention** through ratification and implementation at the national level of Multi-lateral Environmental Agreements. Governments should guarantee the permanence, promotion and development of cultural and natural heritage in local and national communities, giving priority to the precautionary approach in social and environmental risk assessments in policy, planning and implementation [9]
- **Strengthen the ethics and responsibility** of science and scientific community, and decision-makers [15]

1.4 Common but differentiated responsibilities

Industrialised countries need to take special responsibility for assisting poorer countries in addressing pressing environmental, social and economic problems (see section 8. for further recommendations). This includes:

- **Increased market access for developing countries** to financial and trade markets in industrialised countries, through removal of relevant domestic market distorting subsidies and taxes, while respecting necessary and temporary environmental and social taxes and subsidies.
- **Financial support, technology transfer and capacity building** for environmentally sound and socially responsible techniques and practices, as well as economic stabilisation should be provided to build domestic economy, social services and ensure environmental integrity, through significant bilateral and multi-lateral support. However developing countries should still take lead responsibility for the domestic position [7, 14]

The principles need to be defined by a clear and understandable long-term vision of what Sustainable Development will come to look like. The vision should be given further substance with the establishment of clear strategies of how we will get there. Some recommendations for these proposals are outlined below.

1.5 Vision
• Utilise the Earth Charter and similar tools as a means to present coherent and thoughtful set of cross-cultural values and principles to guide local and global leadership for sustainable development [7, 22, 33]

1.6 Strategy

Establish integrated National Strategies for Sustainable Development from which all other national policy is formulated and made coherent.
  - Establish local and regional complimentary strategies
  - All strategies should include specific targets, financial commitments and human resources with a body to monitor and regulate progress
  - All strategies need to be linked to strategies at other levels.
  - All strategies should support multi-stakeholder participation [12, 22]

• Set up specific institutional arrangements i.e. regional, national and local and sub-national councils for sustainable development, to manage the development and progress of a country’s NSSD, involving a cross section of society and greater integration between different tiers of government to ensure coordinated action, participation and partnerships
  - Continue to support and establish new National Councils for Sustainable Development
  - Establish Regional Councils for Sustainable Development, involving civil society, regional bodies e.g. UNEP, Economic Commissions, Development Banks and other multi-lateral bodies, as well as NCSDs to build regional integration and cooperation around transboundary resources, climate change, illegal trade, informational systems, technology sharing.
  - Establish and further support Local Committees/Council for Sustainable Development (LA21) to feed into NSSDs
  - All councils need to be linked to organisations at other levels.
  - All councils should include multi-stakeholder participation [12]

• Strategies and Councils should be further assisted through greater support and funding for initiatives like the UNDP’s Capacity 21 Programme.

• Also the linkages between NSSDs and development processes need to be made more explicit e.g. their relationship to the Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers of the World Bank.
2. Poverty Eradication, Human Security and Human Development

[During the regional meetings governments suggested that the Summit should promote better understanding of linkages between environment, poverty, trade and human security (1.). In order to achieve the Millenium Declaration’s poverty reduction goal to halving the world’s poverty by 2015, they called for a comprehensive and integrated approach to addresses priority areas including:

- **Increasing market access**, employment generation, industrial development, enhancing the role of information and communications (2,5,6).
- **Ensuring adequate financial resources** as well as **debt reduction/cancellation** for developing and transitional economies (2,5).
- **Increased access to basic services**, including health care, water, energy, education, social security. Urgent measures are particularly required to address illiteracy, malnutrition, poor health, poor rural infrastructure and facilities to enhance rural employment opportunities, gender, cultural and social inequalities; especially for the poor, local, traditional people and marginalized communities (5).
- **Judicious utilization of natural resources** (5).
- **Greater role of the private sector and civil society** in development, including gender mainstreaming and development of youth (2).
- **Integrated population policy** aimed at management of the growth rate and the imbalance in the rural-urban population (5).
- **Recognition that “Peace, security stability are prerequisites for sustainable development”** (1)]

At the civil society meetings participants pointed out that persistent poverty and social inequity, environmental insecurity and health are closely inter-related. Inequality in wealth distribution remains a critical issue where, currently the 3 richest people in the world own more than the 48 poorest countries. With greater poverty more and more people are obliged to use land and other resources that are unsuitable or of poor quality, increasing the rate of environmental degradation and further damaging livelihoods. Thus poverty eradication is the first step to sustainability [25, 26, 33]. Improving social, environmental and economic justice and equality will require clear recognition of the link between poverty, over-consumption and the environment [18, 21]. Thus, it is argued that development models need to better reflect human needs, including for sound and productive ecosystems [7]. The 2015 poverty target, as well as commitments in the Millennium Declaration, 20:20 process and Least Developed Countries Conference should be used as a basis to move forward. They indicate that poverty eradication would be addressed through:

2.1 Achieving the International Development Targets

Governments need to work incrementally toward the International Development Targets (IDTs) or Millennium Development Goals (MDG) as defined by the Secretary General’s Road map to the MDGs. This will include:

- **Establishing integrated national, regional and global programmes** toward achieving IDTs, with time-bound targets for the next 5, 10 and 15 years, as well as financial commitments to ensure programmes are realisable. The OECD, G8 an European Union in particular, should be encouraged to implement the development goals they have already agreed to [33]
- **Examining the sustainability implications of new development legislation and policy** before it is implemented, with the participation of multi-stakeholder representatives.
- **Increased resources to tackle the Gender Gap** in social services and development programmes. This will require policies for advancing the gender agenda, to further generate multi-stakeholder stakeholder involvement and expert discussion on the linkages between gender, poverty and the environment [7, 13, 17].
- **Establishing an explicit linkage between development programmes e.g. Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers, to Regional and National Strategies for Sustainable Development.** They should also include the prior informed consent of people in the process of implementation

2.2 Fair and sustainable access to resources
Establishing equitable and sustainable access to and distribution of resources and secure environmental and social rights (see section 1.), calls for:

- **Joint national and regional activities** toward meeting the IDTs, aimed at enhancing economic, political, social inclusion, utilising sustainability indicators and assessment of progress [12, 13].

- **Improving access of the poor to key resources**, including land titles, tenure, education, credit, job security, employment opportunities, agriculture, training and science and ICT e.g. internet villages. Access to land tenure, water rights, genetic resources (including protection of indigenous people’s knowledge), access to credit at affordable rates [7, 9, 13, 20, 32, 33].

- **Establishing mechanisms to ensure basic needs are met** so that people are better able to embrace forward looking policies and reach a better balance between environment and human needs. Strong international and bilateral support should be given to those countries and agencies that are providing education and practical support for family planning and healthcare and education on environment and health, especially wherever population growth remains high and human numbers exceed the local ecological carrying capacity [23, 24].

- **Support the participation of multiple stakeholder groups in assisting poor communities**, where they promote economic self sufficiency and empowerment [13]

- **Legal quotas for migration should be openly and fairly agreed to reduce the indignity and hardship which characterises the illegal movement of people seeking a better life.**

- **Creating work opportunities to enable a decent working environment for all**, especially young people and women, through:
  - o building opportunities for education and skill development, using support groups, educational environment and trainers
  - o encouraging entrepreneurship and increasing their access to information about the opportunities that are available
  - o Workplace agreements on collaborative workplace action towards integrated action and enforcement of core ILO standards e.g. minimum wage, child labour, [22, 23, 33].

2.3 Thorough review and reform of development finance.

Development finance aimed at poverty reduction and sustainable development should see them as inherently linked ventures. This requires a complex policy mix, including:

- **Setting sustainable development at the core of operating guidelines** in global, regional and bilateral development and financial institutions [13]  

- **Avoiding a “one-size fits all” approach to development** (e.g. deregulation and harmonisation of markets), by ensuring a process which is based first and foremost upon the rights of individuals, families and indigenous communities toward seeking improved self sufficiency, democratic and equitable participation, ecologically sound policies and protection of fundamental human rights [8]

- **Development should be assessed against employment and other social indicators** e.g. gender disaggregated data, health, wealth distribution, education, access to resources, information [33]

- **Development banks to finance coordinated sustainable development initiatives** and assist building national and regional economies. There should be better coordination within the donor community and developing countries, including to better monitor the effectiveness and contribution of aid to sustainability, as well as to take better account of potential conflict between environmental and development policies [7, 14, 23]

- **Debt cancellation for the most heavily indebted countries and recognition of ecological debt in industrialised countries**. Debt cancellation and relief is essential to free up domestic finances for more pivotal areas e.g. public service provision, tackling HIV/AIDS, environmental protection [11, 18, 23, 26]

- **Meeting the national commitment towards 0.7% of GNP for Official Development Assistance (ODA)** with an immediate increase in current levels devoted to development assistance and establishment of time table and plans towards meeting or exceeding the 0.7 target [7, 18, 23, 26, 28, 32]

- **Fiscal policies which progressively tax higher income groups** and to redirect the finance generated toward human resource development, especially of women, indigenous and vulnerable groups [13, 33].

- **Scaling down of military expenditure and reallocation of resources** toward poverty alleviation activities [12]
Greater international environmental cooperation, multilateral technical and financial assistance from global institutions, including policies to increase and enhance foreign direct investment, regulate financial markets, improve market access, as well as to enable good governance, development institutions and targeting of aid towards economic enhancement [7, 28]

Investments in science and technology are among the highest yielding investments that a nation can make. Investment, especially in developing countries, needs to be expanded. And increasingly on activities which cut across the disciplines, regions and cultures to help examine the intricate relationship between nature and society [28]

Develop new financial mechanisms to improve the contribution of financial markets to sustainable development e.g. Tobin Tax [7]

2.4 Peace and security

Civil Society meetings called for populations to work together to prevent and mediate social, economic and environmental conflicts (internal and transboundary), openly address social ills and natural environmental hazards. They also called for recognition that a long-term approach is necessary for sustainable development, which requires ensuring the security of person, environment, home and country [24]. They recommended:

- Establishing regional and global, multi-stakeholder, emergency response and disaster relief plans and strategies in preparedness to avert and mitigate natural and human induced disasters [24]
- Greater regional cooperation is needed to better regulate issues of migrant workers, including protection of rights and welfare [24]
- Greater multilateral cooperation (with UN and regional bodies) to stop illegal flow of small arms and weaponry [24]
- Collection and destruction of military arms already in circulation [24]
- To redirect Military Expenditure to more worthwhile goals of sustainable development and make Military Expenditure flows more transparent.
  - Proposed targets included cutting military expenditure by 25% as a first step.
  - Funds that are generated should be reinvested in social development and environmental protection [12, 24]
- To build greater regional solidarity to build good governance and security, increasing accountability and predictability of government and other institutions through:
  - Building democracy and the accepted rule of law
  - Combating corruption - reliability of contracts, e.g. through international adoption and implementation of an Anti-corruption Convention, establishing the International Criminal Court
  - Strengthen the control of trafficking and circulation of weapons, along with its financial enabler – the drugs trade [12,26, 28]
- Reform the UN Security Council to bring in new permanent members reflecting the current balance of power, together with reform of the voting system [23]
- Development of agreed humanitarian basis of UN intervention either to forestall or halt military conflict [23]
- Clarify the links between current wars and conflicts and the current paradigm of development which exploits and discriminates (especially between rich and poor). Targeting in tolerance, illiteracy, discrimination which can encourage conflict [26]
- Establish a UN Volunteer rapid reaction force to be deployed while member states forces are being organised [23]
- Strengthening global agreements to reduce and eliminate nuclear and biological weapons, with appropriate independent inspection arrangements [23]
- Facilitate learning in government and civil society about peace building and peace education to be recognised as major elements of sustainable development. All stakeholders play their part in taking decisions that relate to conflict resolution, peace and nation building [23, 25]
- Ethnic, indigenous, racial, age, gender and religious diversity should be recognised as assets and a source of stabilisation for development. This will require establishment of mechanisms to reduce discrimination and
hostility between groups and lay groundwork for peace and security e.g. through national implementation of Human Rights declaration, the Vienna Convention, the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women, the Migrant peoples Convention, amongst other agreements, such as the ILO convention no. 169 concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples [25, 31]
3. Globalisation: Setting trade and Investment Towards Sustainability

(Governments at the Regional meetings called making globalization more equitable, sustainable and inclusive (1). They noted that the disparities in economic and social welfare between and within countries is growing (2). They felt that the Summit should focus on ways and means of making globalization work for sustainable development. Particular emphasis on enhancing the sustainability of trade, finance, investment and technology, including information technology (1.). They identified the need for:

- **Enhanced global assistance** for enhancing the industrial productivity and competitiveness of developing country industries (1.)
- **Promotion of micro, small and medium-sized enterprises** with a special focus on agro-industry (3).
- **Stronger international cooperation** to address the issues of extreme poverty, underdevelopment, unsustainable production and consumption patterns, environmental degradation and inequities in wealth distribution (4.)
- **Least developed countries to receive increased technical assistance and access to global markets** (6.).

From the civil society processes, stakeholders called for more sweeping reforms. It was generally felt that there is currently a serious political imbalance towards economic governance and systems. Institutions, such as the WTO, have failed to take a balanced account of sustainability concerns [12]. Many argued that trade expansion has worsened socio-environmental conditions and restricted democracies, that the present international trade structure is exploitative and supports the uneven distribution of development gains, further undermining efforts in sustainable development [7]. For example in agriculture, it was felt that the root causes of hunger, food safety decline and loss of smallholder agriculture were directly linked to the “industrial model of agriculture and unbridled trade liberalisation” which fails to account for the massive human and environmental costs of agrochemicals [8]. Groups said that people and the planet must come before profit, and that economies should serve communities, not communities serving economies [18]. They called for a **New Economic Model** to put Sustainable Development at the centre of economic policy, recognising the need for independent monitoring, regulation and verification of markets and TNCs activities and accountability [18, 23].

3.1 Reframing the market

Sustainable development is best achieved through open, competitive, rightly-framed international markets. To enhance the framework within which regional and global trade and investment takes place, international economic institutions, regional economic blocks, development bodies and central banks, governments as well as the private sector need to develop and establish appropriate mechanisms ensuring that domestic and foreign investment supports sustainable development and establish fair terms of trade through new commodity agreements, to steer globalisation to enhance public, private and civic goods, including the equitable distribution of wealth [26], through establishing:

- **Policies which enable ordered and fair competition** among businesses, ensuring equitable trade terms and respect for comparative advantage, along with mechanisms that encourage corporate disclosure and accountability [22, 28]
- **Globally accepted and enforceable standards to reduce the influence of the private sector over individual governments**, e.g. open disclosure of sources of party campaign and programme funds, including wider support for the OECD Convention against Bribery and Corruption [10, 22]
- **A modality within the UN to introduce negotiating obligations on corporate investors** [22]
- **A new global framework for sustainable trade and investment**. For example the development of a Framework Convention for Trans National Corporations (TNCs), based on the OECD Guidelines for Multi-National Corporations and related examples. The agreement would encourage governments to minimise the transfer of polluting industries and practices between countries and reduce the negative social and environmental impacts of free trade and reduced trade barriers [10, 22].

3.2 Enhancing Regional and Global Economic Cooperation

All countries should support activities that realize and share the economic, social and environmental benefits that global-
isation can offer. Governments need to promote policies that stimulate economic growth, take advantage of more open trade and investment, improve the flow of information and technology, as well as promote international environmental cooperation for greater economic integration particularly at the regional level, aiming to facilitate balanced progress towards sustainable development [26].

- **Implement of economic policies based on the Polluter Pays Principle** and full cost accounting to better incorporate environmental costs of trade and investment, including the removal of environmentally “perverse subsidies” [7,8, 10, 20, 22, 28]
- **The development of global rules for public finance**, investment and procurement aimed at furthering sustainable development, such as through clearer obligations on export credit rating agencies. Also through adopting consistent, fair and transparent accounting standards [7, 10, 11, 33]
- **Capacity building and technological cooperation should be enhanced in governments and institutions, particularly to:**
  - Increase the ability to dialogue between trade and environment ministers
  - Action to bring safeguards and plan for employment displacement caused by new technologies, including biotechnology
  - Promote the progress of youth and women to cope with impacts and opportunities of globalisation [10, 23, 25, 33].
- **Industrialised countries need to reduce market barriers and increase market access** for developing countries’ goods and services. Promote progress and prosperity in developing countries, by creating opportunities to enable those countries to participate and benefit from economic and information markets [28].
- **Carry out research** to increase global understanding of the interdependent relationship between globalisation, environment and development [28]
- **Global as well as regional trade blocks should focus on strengthening local economies**, particularly within small and medium enterprises and entrepreneurs, towards establishing practices of:
  - Fair trade and equity and benefit sharing;
  - Promoting sustainable production and consumption [30];
- **Raise awareness and encourage participation by the private sector in recognising the need to better integrate social and environmental policy within a framework of globalisation**, through partnership within the UN system and with other stakeholder groups.

### 3.3 Enhancing Corporate Accountability

The private sector plays a crucial role in enhancing quality of life and must rise to new challenges in the pursuit of sustainable development. This will include adoption of practices such as:

- **The concept of Industrial Ecology should be further developed**, including full cost pricing of environmental goods and services [28]
- **Promote dialogue on Corporate Social Responsibility and labour standards**, to build positive relationships between trade unions, environment and human rights groups, local authorities and business in pursuit of the goals of Agenda 21, including how to further implement the OECD Guidelines or Multi-national Enterprises [33]
- **Re-examine the use of voluntary codes of conduct**, to introduce regulatory systems, linked to standards and multi-stakeholder verification, reporting and evaluation criteria [33]
- **Sustainability impact assessments** should be applied to corporate products and policies [7]
- **Sustainability reporting** should be utilised, with the provision of clear, independently verified and reliable corporate information, e.g. labelling and annual reports [7,8, 10]
- **Industry should promote the progress of women to cope with impacts and opportunities of globalisation** [10]

### 3.4 Reframing global trading principles

In recognising the need to reshape trade agreements towards achieving greater social equity, economic development and environmental maintenance, the WTO must set sustainability as the guiding principle throughout all trade negotiations.
The establishment of a mechanism for resolution of trade vs socio-economic and environment disputes. Mechanisms, e.g. observer status, working groups, should be built into the negotiating protocols to ensure that ecological and social concerns are represented by both civil society and relevant UN agencies e.g. UNEP, FAO, WHO, and agreements, e.g. Convention on Biological Diversity, Framework Convention on Climate Change, Convention in International Trade of Endangered Species [11, 23].

The provision of a formal structure, between the WTO and the ILO, to address trade and core labour issues, in consultation with employers and trade unions. Develop new forms of cooperation in the workplace issues, between ILO, WTO and other bodies, to further instigate the ILO’s conventions [24, 33].

To utilise Sustainability Impact Assessments, by sector prior to the negotiation of trade and investment agreements, ensuring:

- Democratic mechanisms with full stakeholder participation, to ensure negotiation conditions and agreements safeguard social justice and environmental sustainability, with benefits for all and where significant ethical, social, environmental costs are incurred in a particular sector, e.g. Water Supply and Sanitation.
- Liberalisation should be fully assessed and avoided if the impacts are found not to support these objectives.
- Encourage the involvement of trade unions in the development of social indicators that assist the integrate of economic and environment dimension.
- No new trade round should take place without evaluating the impact of present trade agreements on developing countries, women and men and the natural environment [7, 9, 10, 13, 25, 29].

A task force, appointed by the Secretary-General of the UN and the G8, should be established to devise the necessary changes in global and regional trade systems [26].
4. Sustainable Production and Consumption

“So long as development is understood to be an ever continuing growth of material consumption, sustainable development is a contradiction in terms and an illusion. The world is finite, and economic growth based on increased consumption of non-renewable resources and the dissipation of renewable resources cannot continue indefinitely.”

New Renaissance Group

Governments underlined that, alongside poverty eradication, sustainable production and consumption patterns are overarching objectives of sustainable development. They recognised that progress has been slow in decoupling of economic growth from pressures on the environment or natural resource base. Although they made few specific commitments, governments made more general statements identifying the need for developing a “new environmental ethic” in production and consumption patterns (1.). Calling for:

- **Modification of world consumption patterns**, particularly in developed countries
- **All countries to promote the transition to less resource intensive patterns of resource consumption** (6.)
- **Introduction of measures to increase energy efficiency** (2.)

Stakeholder representatives recognised that over-consumption by wealthy countries, organisations and individuals is often a cause of environmental degradation and the exacerbation of poverty. In order to repay their ecological debt to developing countries, the elite rich in developing countries and people in industrialised nations more generally will need to undertake radical changes in lifestyle. There is an urgent need to make production all over the world safer, cleaner and more effective and socially accountable [25]. Conservation of wild and cultivated biodiversity should be seen of the utmost value, both for the present and the unknown future. Therefore there is a need to establish new economic models – that are targeted more effectively towards the quality rather than quantity of consumption. Recommendations included:

4.1 Promoting sustainable and efficient market transformation

Markets need to be re-orientated to promote the application of the precautionary approach and the polluter-pays principal, as well as more broadly so that they can advance progress towards sustainable development. This should tackle both ends of the markets, the producers and consumers, as well as their intermediaries [28], through:

- **Greater customer and public information** including labelling of products and public awareness campaigns. Providing consumers with the necessary information and tools to make individual decisions in support of sustainable development. [33]
- **Enhance accountability of product labelling** through independent verification
- **Focus activities on specific sectors** e.g. the consumption links between poverty and food insecurity [7, 10, 11]
- **Target consumer groups and the workplace**. For example youth and workers are heavily targeted as consumers and should be seen as a critical group in making the shift to sustainable consumption, through education and green agreements between employers and employees, workplace environmental management systems and eco-management [18, 33]
- **Development of regional instruments that impose strict liability on transboundary environmental damage**
- **Develop and implement national environmental rules** based on sound science and an applied understanding of risk assessment and economic impacts [28] such as through:
  - The introduction and enforcement of clear legal standards e.g. through use of ISO codes
  - Greater use of market instruments e.g. tradable permits
  - Introduction of ecological taxes and incentives to reduce environmental damage, full-cost pricing of goods and services
  - Perverse subsidies that promote unsustainable production should be identified and phased out. Although where markets are regulated in response to clear public mandates, including through subsidies, they should be regulated in favour of public interests [7, 23,24, 28]

4.2 Increase corporate responsibility
Within the corporate sector it is felt that good corporate practice is spread more effectively by example, persuasion and peer pressure – rather than prescriptive codes and regulations. Leadership, innovation, competition and transparency are also key factors to success, defined as being “achieved by the delivery of competitively priced goods and services that satisfy human needs and bring quality of life, while progressively reducing ecological impacts and resource intensity throughout the life cycle, to a level at least in line with the Earth’s estimated carrying capacity.”. The business case needs to adopt the principle of “triple bottom line”, based on financial, social, and environmental performance. This will be enabled by demonstrating good corporate practice and responsible business conduct through programmes developed by individual [28]. More specific activities include:

- **Full cost pricing of environmental goods and services** – including the capital costs for resources depletion, waste generation and mitigation in commercial and public accounts. Sustainable practice may increase the financial costs of goods and therefore people, especially poorer communities will require support in making the transition [14, 32]

- **Sustainability impact assessments, reporting and monitoring** of products and policies [7]

- **Provision of reliable information** to consumers (e.g. through labelling and advertising). Business should accept responsibility for informing consumers about the social and environmental effects of those choices, and allow for independent verification [7, 28].

- **Further development of the concept of industrial ecology** through implementation of voluntary codes of conduct, pushing leaders in corporate practice ahead of legislation. Eco-efficiency’ includes four aspects:
  - **De-materialization** – knowledge flows replacing material flows, also better Product Customisation to better meet real levels customer demand
  - **Closing production loops** - using biological designs in nature as role model for production. Creating “closed-loop” and “zero-waste” production processes
  - **Service extension** – moving from a supply-driven to demand-pull economy. Satisfying demand and customising responses for client needs e.g. leasing durables, end of life return for recycling by manufacturer
  - **Functional extension** – “smarter” products with enhanced functional value [14, 28]

- **Promotion of collective action and participation** on accepted sustainability targets in different industries, in order to more effectively meet desired and strategic production and consumption patterns. [7, 33]

- **Establish clear global rules for regulation of private business and finance sector, especially transnational corporations**. This could include:
  - A legally binding framework for corporate accountability and liability under the UN, determined in an open and transparent manner [7]
  - Linking and building upon initiatives, such as the UNEP Financial Initiative, the Global Compact and Global Reporting Initiative. They should also directly participate in a revision of the OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises, and various other initiatives such as the Global Sullivan Principles. However the Global Compact needs to be reframed to ensure that the companies involved are in fact complying with the principles it defines and the process allows for other stakeholders to more effectively participate [7, 28].

- **Increase the trust worthiness of initiatives** through wider stakeholder inclusion in such process, as well as joint worker/employer in verification and assessments, as the basis of joint workplace target setting and implementation of sustainable development objectives, linking production and consumption processes [7, 11].

- **Sustainable Travel & Tourism**. The tourism sector requires particular focus as the world’s largest industry and creator of jobs, accounting for as much as 12% of global GDP and nearly 200 million jobs in the world-wide economy. The challenge is to manage the future growth of the industry to minimise its negative impacts on the environment and host communities, whilst maximising the benefits it brings in terms of jobs, wealth and support for local culture and industry, and protection of the built and natural environment. Activities should include:
  - Reducing financial leakages and increasing local domestic financial retention through encouraging the diverse range of products and services directly and indirectly associated to tourism, to be supplied by different operators, including small or medium sized businesses in local ownership
  - Airlines and airports working to reduce pollution and noise impacts. Cruise liners practising marine conservation. Hotels implementing energy consumption and waste disposal programs. Car rental companies investing in fuel efficient fleets, Railways sound proofing to dampen noise
  - Certification e.g. UNEP, World Tourism Organisation, WWF, Tourism Concern, WTTC, “GREEN GLOBE” initiative.
Focus on workers in the tourist industry, to recognise that access is directly related to disposable income, benefits and security, where those who work in the industry are often those who can least afford to take a “holiday”, therefore need to ensure minimum standards of working conditions, especially women, through implementation of ILO Conventions e.g. No.183 on maternity protection, occupational health and safety, domestic workloads, infant care [33].

4.3 Stimulate public debate and participation

Many called for greater freedom of choice, ensuring equal access for all to the natural environment whilst respecting the limited carrying capacities [30]. To enhance quality of life whilst protecting the environment and promoting social equity, means that consumers and society need information and price signals to make intelligent and fair decisions. Activities include:

- **Wide public debate**, which is urgently needed to address the concepts of full cost recovery and eco-efficiency, considering their possible socio-economic and environmental implications. Discussion should involve indigenous people, trade unions, workers, women, and other stakeholders in the process [12, 27]
- **Mass media advertising** to encourage a change in patterns of over consumption, especially in the industrialised world. Strong messages are needed about our rights and responsibilities as consumers and citizens, to live well but limit environmental impacts and respect the rights of all people to life and work in safe and healthy environments [26]
- **Development and sharing of new and existing technologies** should be encouraged to promote sustainable production and consumption, with an emphasis on local, culturally appropriate and low cost approaches [27]
- **Greater investment in cutting-edge technologies** is vital to further reduce energy and resource requirements, including greater recognition of indigenous knowledge, an use of technologies appropriate to local requirements [27]
- **Utilising social sciences** to give insights and guidance to facilitate the transition to sustainable consumption patterns, especially in industrialised countries [27]

4.4 Local and national public role

Developed countries in particular should take the lead in reducing consumption of material resources and in lessening their ecological impact elsewhere. Governments need to lead by example. They should develop plans or frameworks for achieving Sustainable Production and Consumption targets, in open consultation with public and stakeholder groups. The targets should include all sectors e.g. retail and recreation, forestry, mining, food, energy, manufacturing, construction, investment and banking, etc [7]. Clearer market signals will be needed to tilt the majority of businesses and consumers toward sustainable practices [28]

- **“Greening” public accounts and procurement.** National accounts should include natural resources and use of ecological services in their statements, where measurable. Government, at all levels, can also use procurement to create markets for sustainable products and promote sustainable consumption patterns, to:
  - Incorporate all costs and impacts of the full life cycle of a product, including all goods and services.
  - Incorporation of environmental resource use in Standard National (and Business) Accounts
  - To remove barriers that reduce incentives to sound procurement, including procurement related to development programmes, by move away from unsustainable forms of procurement and development, including oil drilling, mining and large hydro-power projects
  - To establish collective procurement mechanisms for government institutions to create more effective public sector demand for sustainable products
  - Introduce policies which hold producers accountable for their advertising campaigns
  - Environmental laws, remove subsidies that support polluting production processes, green taxes, public eco-campaigns [16, 25, 26]

- **Serving local needs first.** The production of food, consumables and other goods should seek to serve local markets as a first priority, whilst the adverse affects of transport, processing and packaging should be minimised. For example, local authorities with sub-national and national governments should build in integrated planning for transport systems – for pedestrians, cyclists, and public transport to minimise the needs to move goods and people
and increase telecommunications technology [23, 24, 32]

• **Re-orientate and integrate planning and investment.** Further coordinate planning, such as transport and housing development systems in order to better provide consumers and public service providers with greater opportunities for sustainable and resource efficient lifestyles. Governments should establish quality of life indices to place purely material indices of economic success and target resource efficient structures that make the most economical use of human, natural and financial resources.
5. Natural Resources: Integrated Management and Regulation

The regional government meetings generally indicated that the Summit should develop specific initiatives in areas of: Fresh water and sanitation; Oceans and seas, coastal zones; Mountains, land use, forests and desertification; Biodiversity; Minerals and metals; Air quality and climate change. Although there were few specific policy recommendations, governments particularly sought movement on:

- **Further development of National Environmental Action Plans (NEAPs)**, to be integrated into broader National Strategies for Sustainable Development
- **Ensuring equitable access to the benefits** afforded by the use of natural and genetic resources
- **Promote sub-regional, regional cooperation**, including participation of national and international financial sectors in the prevention and mitigation of the effects of natural disasters (4). Establishment of early warning systems, using of modern technologies, e.g. satellite technology, and effective implementation of comprehensive hazard and risk management plans through greater regional cooperation (1.).
- **Stronger commitment and coherence** (resources, ratification and implementation) within MEAs (1.)
- **A reduction in resource intensive and polluting industries** (1.)
- **Land degradation**, including desertification, is closely related to poverty and a severe restraint to sustainable development (1.)
  - The WSSD should acknowledge the UNCCD as a sustainable development convention and as a prime tool in the eradication of poverty in regions in Africa
- **Forests**:
  - The implementation of the Plan of Action of the UN Forum on Forests. In the context of the plan of action of the UN Forum on Forests, international efforts on forests are required in relation to capacity building, financial resources and technology transfer. Holistic efforts are need to address illegal logging, illegal trade in timber, non-timber forest products and genetic resources (6.)
- **Food security and agriculture**:
  - Aim to double agricultural production in Africa within five years.
  - Ensure substantial increase in the finance provided to the agricultural sector, particularly by the international financial institutions and by GEF for the full implementation of UNCCD;
  - Call for the developed countries to remove their agricultural subsidies and to apply the precautionary principle in the context of genetically modified food (3.)
  - Pursuit of sustainable agriculture and rural development (SARD), while reducing trade distortions is essential (1.)
- **Energy and climate change**:
  - Deliver (by the Summit) a deal that promotes global access to energy, including special initiatives for promoting the share of renewable and affordable energy (1.).
  - Foster energy efficiency and to diversify energy supply including increasing the share of renewable sources. To develop and use affordable clean energy technologies and increase use of renewable energy and, to implement policies to reduce the material and energy intensity of production and consumption, (4., 5., 6.)
  - as well as mitigate the associated negative impacts on the environment. (5.)
  - Efforts related to climate change and sustainable energy development should focus on capacity building, technology transfer and improved access to new technologies (6.)
  - Development of adaptation strategies in face of to climate change, climate variability, sea level rise and other climatic change impacts. Requiring mobilization of resources for adaptation and assessment of the implications of all the adaptation needs and options (6.)
  - Assist developing countries, especially least developed countries and small island developing states and economies in transition in capitalizing on funding opportunities. (6.)
  - To improve the accuracy of seasonal forecasting of monsoons and the understanding of the regional water cycles. This includes promotion of regional cooperation in joint research on climate observation. (6.)
- **Water**:
  - Achievement of the Millennium Declaration target on access to water and sanitation services. The Sum-
mit should deliver a programme of action for the achievement of the Millennium Declaration target on access to water and sanitation services (3.)

- Promotion of the integrated water management approach, emphasising cross-sectoral and decentralized management (1.)
- Need to apply economic and market mechanisms to deal with the increasing scarcity of water resources.
- Enhance international and regional cooperation on water in shared ecosystems (6.)

**Oceans:**

- Effective cooperation among national, sub-regional, regional and international institutions responsible for marine and ocean protection and management;
- Implementation of national, sub-regional and regional policies enhancing the sustainable management and use of oceans and their resources
- Promotion of total ecosystem management of marine resources through capacity-building; improving access to survey and monitoring technologies
- Full and integrated implementation of the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, the Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and Their Disposal and other conventions
- Establish measures to address and reduce the vulnerability of islands, including the development of acceptable vulnerability indices
- Further implementation of the Barbados Plan of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States, including its review in 2004. (6.)

During the civil society meetings, stakeholders focused on cross cutting aspects before touching on issue specific recommendations. Ecosystem resources and services were identified as particularly important for the eradication of poverty. Governments, in open consultation, should set targets to bring the ecological footprint of all countries into balance with the Earth’s carrying capacity, through better stewardship of environmental functions and services utilising ecosystems management approach and collaborative partnerships to aid the creation of sustainable livelihoods [12, 31].

### 5.1 Cross-cutting priorities

- **Strengthened regional coordination and cooperation** for transboundary resources, climate change and illegal trade of species, including information exchange and resources on ecosystems and technologies for sound management [13]

  - **Increase consumer and civil society awareness**, involvement and pressure to protect and restore ecosystems, both domestically and internationally, through:
    - Certification schemes
    - Public education and advertising campaigns
    - Engagement and participation of civil society in the development of policies, programmes and natural resource legislation
    - Adopt and strengthen community-based resources management
    - Strengthen advocacy for compliance within existing and new international agreements [10, 13]

- **Establish policies linking biodiversity conservation with poverty eradication**, especially in local and indigenous communities that live around protected areas, through sustainable use of natural resources. Governments should recognize conservation of biological diversity should be integral to regional and national development planning, to maintain also ethnic and cultural biodiversity and ensure more equitable access and control of good quality resources [9]

- **Governments should reject the use of intellectual property rights over the living beings and support the protection of collective intellectual rights of local and indigenous communities in their traditional knowledge** and their capacity for innovation. Biological and environmental knowledge of women, indigenous and local communities needs more formal and wide recognition, such as through
  - Recognition of the role of the International Indigenous Forum on Biodiversity to the COP of the Convention on Biological Diversity,
  - The establishment of an Ad-hoc Open-Ended Working Groups on Access and Benefit Sharing [9,31]

- **Adopt an precautionary approach, including:**
Development of preventative strategies to mitigate risk from natural resource scarcity, disasters and for chronic problems e.g. waste disposal, should be in place.

- Avoidance of critical natural thresholds and irreversible effects, such as species extinction, through effective regulation and monitoring
- Adequate recognition and protection of indigenous peoples land and territories
- Undertake risk analyses and management of urban and rural planning
- Undertake risk analyses and management of genetic modification of life forms
- Further assessment of the gender impacts of natural disasters e.g. floods, landslides and drought, through a stronger partnership between the Commission on the Status of women and CSD [15, 25, 31]

**Ecological Economics**

- Eliminate and reduce environmentally perverse subsidies from resource intensive industries, e.g. agriculture, forest, fishing and mining, and encourage greater financial investment in maintaining ecosystem services e.g. mangroves, coral reefs, catchment areas. Identification and assessment of such subsidies should involve participation of civil society. Steps to mitigate negative socio-economic impacts from subsidy removal should be openly developed and implemented.
- Demand side management should be further utilised in natural resource sectors energy, water, forest, land
- Full cost accounting should be introduced through environmental taxes and charges, so that the capital costs for resource depletion and waste generation are included in commercial and national accounts, and useful as indicators for decision-makers
- Not all natural resource values are monetary or easily quantifiable. It is therefore practical to develop a wider portfolio of methodologies and tools which could be applied by lay people at regional and local levels, using an ecosystems approach
- Innovative market-based mechanisms should be further developed to create corporate incentives for management of scarce resources e.g. tradable permits, and the use of industrial ecology as a core management tool
- International regulation of foreign direct investment should be introduced to ensure that investment is environmentally sound [10, 14]

**Improve research and technology transfer.**

- Indigenous knowledge should be better recognized and acknowledged to aid understanding of ecosystems and sustainable resource use.
- Formulate common benchmarks and indicators to assess progress and change in natural resources. Encourage integrated national environmental status reports.
- Greater regional flow and coordination of environmental information would assist transboundary assessments and policy formulation [10, 11, 14, 31]

### 5.2 Enhancing the Multi-Lateral Environmental Agreements (MEAs)

Governments, as member of the MEAs and the UNEP’s Governing Council, need to work towards:

**Strengthening coordination, ratification and enforcement** of all MEAs and their associated protocols and agreements, including:

- Climate Change (including Kyoto Protocol),
- Ozone,
- Biodiversity (including Jakarta Mandate and Biosafety protocol),
- Desertification,
- Wetlands (Ramsar),
- Illegal Trade of Endangered Species,
- Hazardous wastes,
- Law of the Sea (including Migratory and Straddling Fish Stocks Agreement.
- Persistent Organic Pollutants
- Rotterdam Convention on Prior Informed Consent [7, 11, 30,31]
To fully ratify and enforce other relevant international conventions and regional agreements, including the full implementation of Aarhus Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters, extending its principles to other countries. Also to further implement the ILO Convention No. 155 on workplace participation and access to information. [13, 33]

Strengthen compliance and regulation of laws and policies through
- Independent, clear and accurate monitoring, reporting and verification, utilising experiences from elsewhere, such as the worker/trade union verification models [33].
- Increased investment (domestic and international) in a stronger public sector at the national and local levels.
- Minimising the opportunities for MEA related trade disputes through agreeing on a set of principles to guide resolution of trade related environmental measures, as well as strengthened MEA compliance and dispute settlement mechanisms [10]

Improve capacity and resources available to implement, monitor and enforce international agreements, particularly at local level; build funding mechanisms to enhance implementation, including the development of SMART sustainable development indicators [7, 10]

Develop legislative frameworks for integrated natural resource management and institute ecosystem-based planning and governance mechanisms to better coordinate between legal, economic and environmental systems from national to international levels, including regional instruments on strict liability for environmental damage, in order to better tie-in the aims of the MEAs.

Increase cooperation and collaboration between all stakeholders and responsible institutions, to:
- Assess and integrate the socio-economic dimension in MEAs implementation, including establishing informal working groups between UNEP and MEAs and other relevant bodies to explore and clarify the relationship between Bretton Woods Institutions and WTO to UNEP and MEAs, as well as to the ILO Conventions;
- Build consensus between governments and civil society on the mechanisms for implementation and enforcement
- 80% of the world’s remaining biodiversity is within the territories of indigenous peoples, since their practices have allowed them to safeguard the well-being of all life forms. Thus the summit should more clearly recognise the link between indigenous people and biodiversity [7, 10, 11, 17, 33]

International support of campaigns to engage local and sub-national governments in undertaking collective action to fulfill national commitments of MEAs [26]

5.3 Food Security, Sustainable Agriculture and Rural Development

The traditional intensive western model of farming production is unsustainable, as has been indicated through recent problems in Europe e.g. mad cow, foot and mouth disease, with severe waste environmental and social problems. Furthermore, recognition that 70% of the world’s poorest are in rural areas means that political will and investment is urgently needed to build up community-based food security and rural development. Governments and international agencies need to work to ensure sustainability is applied in agriculture, to promote best farming and environmental practices in food products and production techniques. Including practices which are cost effective, scientifically sound and environmentally sustainable, including technology cooperation and capacity building, especially in developing countries [20, 30, 32]. Activities include

Equitable participation. Governments and the farming industry should encourage inter-disciplinary and multi-stakeholder processes, seeking partnerships with relevant international agencies and stakeholders worldwide. The central role of women, indigenous and poor peoples, NGOs, trade unions and farm-workers must be addressed in the development of farming policies and programmes. In particular, policies to increase partnerships and mentoring of good practice and increasing gender equity must become more substantive, with greater incorporation in decision-making for policy, research, trade and technology issues relating to food and agriculture. [30, 31]

The world-wide debate on Sustainable Agriculture and Food Systems (SAFS) needs to be increased, through the creation of a Global Public Policy Network, with an action-orientated agenda. Involving many
stakeholders, including local communities to endorse and implement best management practices which are suitable to local conditions, and strengthen the role of women and youths in SARDs processes. This could include discussions to:

- Assess the root causes of hunger, food safety decline and loss of smallholder agriculture,
- Assess the impact of the current industrial model of agriculture and animal production, moves toward unbridled trade liberalisation,
- Consider the consumption links to poverty and food insecurity, including the role of fair trade principles in improving food production standards
- Identify policies seeking to resolve trade, environment and agricultural disputes [9]

**Application of the precautionary principle in food production and processing, fishing and animal husbandry** to reduce agricultural and industrial risks and pollution. This includes the implementation of

- Clean-up practices,
- Technological reforms,
- Stronger enforcements mechanisms
- Regulation of corporate ownership of freshwater and other natural resources [11].

**Create an enabling environment** for sustainable practices and processes drawn from eco-system approaches and bio-diversity enhancing food systems, to be further developed and incorporated at all levels. Governments and relevant agencies should ensure a diversity of domestic and export food production and promotion, through:

- Guaranteeing access to food which is GMO free and sustainably produced
- Preserving the existing variety of indigenous seeds and species
- Promoting organic farming
- They also provide the support required to put the technology in place throughout the food chain and to ensure that the consumer is offered healthy foodstuffs
- Establishing policies and guidelines encourage sustainable agricultural practices, to properly regulate agricultural inputs and food safety standards
- Assist poor people in making the transition to long term sustainable practice which may have long term financial costs,
- Investment to support rural infrastructure e.g. transport, health, education, legislation, communication and technology
- Create a rural sustainable development plan or framework with bottom-up, input from the farming and rural community [10, 32]

**The agriculture and food industry need to further cooperate with farmers and other stakeholders**, to develop appropriate technologies, through innovation, research, investment, information and educational activities, for a sufficient and sustainable food production system. Agri-food businesses, upstream and downstream of the farmer in the food chain, can provide additional support through:

- Promoting integrated farming systems e.g. Integrated Pest and Plant Nutrition Management.
- Ensuring that farmers receive the information they require to optimise the yield potential of their crops and livestock, to protect them from pests and diseases in the most environmentally and socially acceptable manner
- Developing more diversified income generating opportunities e.g. agri-tourism
- Developing new sustainable methods to tackle critical problems in agriculture e.g. organic farming and water conservation. For example soil erosion by wind and water can be minimised through conservation, crop rotation and fallow seasons, as well as minimum tillage systems to stabilise topsoil, reduce energy consumption, and enhance yield
- Further implementation of the ILO Convention on Safety and Health in Agriculture [28, 32];

**Sustainable land resources management for food production**. National and local governments need to put into place:

- Comprehensive, community based and integrated land use planning which promotes sustainability, including setting up programmes to improve soil quality and sound water management
- Policies, information and guidelines encourage sustainable land use planning practices, species protection and partnership promotion for good practice
- Maintain and recognise traditional knowledge, cultural and spiritual relationships which assist the con
servantion of biodiversity in productive systems

- Create eco-settlements and eco-housing projects incorporating green space, restoration of the natural environment, promoting sustainable energy use and low water consumption [17, 31, 32]

- **Fair and efficient food trade** will require:
  - The alignment of food prices at world market levels and progressive dismantling of price-distortions arising from subsidies
  - Trade and investment in the agri-business sector, especially in developing countries, including investing in infrastructure to ensure the safe and efficient production, processing, and transportation of food within and between countries
  - Governments, with support of farmers and other stakeholders, should develop certification schemes and codes of conduct for sustainable farming practices and technologies
  - Governments, rural agencies and local authorities must work, together with stakeholders, to promote initiatives to help rural communities go beyond producing food for families to assist generation of income, to build rural capacity, and sustainable practice. This requires markets opportunities and technical assistance to exploit those opportunities. Women, indigenous and small farmers need support to buy, sell, and mortgage land, purchase seed, fertilizer and equipment, gain access to markets and credit, and remain competitive as markets become more open e.g. microcredit programmes, promotion of economic organisation of small farmers e.g. collectives and cooperatives
  - The farming community should have the right to freely use diverse genetic resources, including seeds, which have been developed by them throughout history [32]

### 5.4 Energy and Climate Change

- **Furthering adoption and implementation of the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change**, Governments need to undertake activities including:
  - **Ratification, early implementation and entry into force of the Kyoto Protocol** (KP) to the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change. A firm consensus for action on climate change is needed and all sectors of society must be called upon to play their part in implementing change.
  - **Government and corporate targets should go beyond savings targets defined in KP**, through: increased energy conservation; promotion of environmentally sound, energy efficient and renewable energy sources
  - **Invest in building the renewable energy market** to more than 10% of total energy market by 2010 and increasing access to affordable renewable energy in poor and rural areas. They need to target financial flows to finance the transition to alternative energy sources e.g. solar, biomass, geothermal and in the development of new energy projects.
  - **Industrialised countries should establish programmes to take better account of the needs of poorer countries, indigenous communities and the poor in development and use of renewables**, as well as gaining access to technology and resources to ensure adequate and sustainable energy provision
  - **Support consumption changes**, through: training and education to encourage a shift to renewables; the introduction of green taxes to include the environmental costs in the pricing of unsustainable sources of energy; encouraging workplace energy conservation measures and workplace assessments. Steady phasing out of nuclear, fossil fuels and large-scale hydroelectric dams
  - **Develop adaptation strategies** to reduce and mitigate the impact of climate change on societies and ecosystems. For example local governments will need to incorporate climate protection into the construction of new housing, by designing houses with the maximum energy efficiency allocating houses in an area convenient to existing transport services [7, 10, 11, 12, 14, 24, 26, 29, 31]

- **The International Community** should:
  - **Establish an International Renewable Energy Agency** to promote national programmes, report on progress.
  - **Develop and implement plans to reduce and mitigate for motorised transport and develop sustainable alternatives**
  - **OECD, ILO and EU should cooperate to carry out further research**, including assessments of the employment and social implications of climate change; potential mitigation measures; the risks inherent
in including plantations in the Clean Development Mechanism; subsidies and other drivers for unsustainable energy and transportation

- **Clear and instructive information about climate change should be made available to all** [7, 11]

- **Business community should aim to adopt three broad goals for energy sustainability** *Accessibility, Availability and Acceptability* (World Energy Council study “Energy for Tomorrow’s World - Acting Now”):
  - **Accessibility to energy**, which is both affordable (for the poor), and environmentally and economically viable (prices which reflect the real costs of energy production, transmission and distribution)
  - **Availability of good quality and reliable energy**, requires a diversified energy portfolio consistent with particular national circumstances including the means to harness new energy sources
  - **Acceptability of energy supply** in meeting environmental goals and public needs. New and readily available technologies have already reduced emissions. Environmentally friendly technologies have to be further developed, diffused, maintained and expanded to all parts of the world. There is a need to foster local capacity to ensure that the technologies can be developed, used and maintained by local people [28]

- **The knowledge and skills of local and indigenous peoples, as well as other stakeholders, should be further encouraged and used to compliment scientific work** on climate and its impacts [31].

- **New infrastructure, technologies, and maintenance of deteriorating systems will benefit from additional and targeted public and private finance.** Also to further expand energy services will require market reform within effective regulatory frameworks.

- **Promote greater energy efficiency.** Industry and government can work together to implement energy efficiency programs that save energy and money, improve air quality e.g. through increasing customer awareness of how to use energy wisely, the development and diffusion of cost-effective technologies with minimum standards in energy equipment and service, direct or indirect price mechanisms (market based mechanisms e.g. removing subsidies, incorporating environmental and social externalities).

- **The road, air, maritime and rail transport industries.** While efficient transport systems are a necessity for economic development, systems need to better reflect social equity and welfare, as well as reduce the adverse impact on the environment. Businesses, trade unions and local authorities need to work to encourage efficient comfortable and cheap alternatives to private car use, to build sustainable transportation. For example the World Business Council for Sustainable Development “Sustainable Mobility Project” seeks to deliver mobility solutions that make economic and business sense, whilst ensuring a sustainable environment [28, 33]

### 5.5 Freshwater

Water is a public good, and governments should keep it as such, especially for basic water provision. Governments must promote Integrated Water Resource Management at the catchment area level, ensuring equitable access for populations to the resource whilst taking into account ecological needs[7, 30, 32]. Including:

- **Preparing and implementing national and river basin, integrated water resources management**, plans in principle and practice will require:
  - **Formal procedures for ensuring accountability**, including local consultation and participation of local women, men, children and other stakeholder groups at the earliest stages of decision-making. All stakeholders should be actively and legally involved in the decision-making processes on freshwater management. Partnerships for sustainable water use and management should be encouraged between urban and rural areas and across regions.
  - **Consumption practices in domestic, agricultural and industrial water usage should be influenced through regulatory instruments** e.g. Imposition of charges in waste produced and water consumed within the region and reduce use of freshwater as a carrier of wastes; workplace assessments to promote wise use of water at the workplace level; the establishment of water users organisations; development of education and awareness raising programmes for water users
  - **Application of a watershed/aquifer approach within IWRM**, as well as wider integration of ecosystem conservation and management e.g. through incorporation of IWRMs in National Environmental Action Plans
  - **Governments must maintain and develop international environmental law** protecting freshwater through prompt ratification and efficient creation of international treaties. This will require investment
to maintain and restore healthy river basin ecosystems. Governments should agree to protect mountain –
on a catchments basis

o **Establishing comprehensive water strategies at national and regional levels**, applying to all parties,
including: Conservation and wise use of the resource base; Recycling and reuse whenever feasible and
economic; Waste treatment to facilitate recycle and reuse options; Water basin and water catchments
management to allocate scarce resources most effectively; Management of underground water and aquifer
systems; Phasing out of inappropriate subsidies which encourage unwise use of scarce water re-
sources; Assessing the interactions between activities that affect water resources both directly and indi-
rectly to assist development of the most innovative solutions.

o **Create an enabling environment** of governance in national water policy, including establishing basic
water law and adequate commercial legal systems, e.g. through developing a flexible regulatory frame
work. There need to be further support for decentralised policymaking and implementation. This re-
quires capacity building to ensure local government regulators are competent to negotiate contracts and
establish appropriate guidelines reflecting various stakeholder positions.

o **Also establish national reporting procedures**, with social and environmental indicators on water, in-
cluding assessment of equitable access, affordability, workplace indicators

o **Local governments can assist the implementation of regulatory and incentive systems** in sustain-
able water strategies to increase access to new water sources and improve water delivery, including
through: pollution charges; eco-procurement; facilitating the implementation of green technologies;
public education; implementation of groundwater and surface water protection plans; forging local gov-
ernment community partnerships [10, 11, 13, 24, 28, 32,]

- **Access to Freshwater Supply and Sanitation (WSS)** needs to be guaranteed by governments through:

  o **Applying the principle of subsidiarity**. Ensuring the ownership of water should remain in the hands of
the users and user associations or other community based management of water, will require increased
legal protection and political space for the poor to better communicate their water needs regarding quan-
tity and quality of service as well as other poverty alleviation strategies e.g. promoting right to employ-
ment and adequate incomes

  o **Transparent and well regulated investments in WSS**. Water privatisation as a conditionality imposed
by multinational financial institutions is not acceptable. Water services contracted to the private sector
will require strong regulations which are realistically enforceable, providing a means of true account-
ability

  o **As a public good, trade liberalisation of water and wastewater services under the WTO General
Agreement on Trade in Services is to be avoided** on socio-economic, environmental and ethical
grounds. There needs to be a thorough review and evaluation of privatisation policies [33]

  o **Offering free access to a minimum amount of water to all** e.g. 50 litres per person per day located
within 1km of a users dwelling (OECD target)

  o **Develop a global Code of Conduct for water management and water pricing**. Governments should
create an enabling environment for stakeholder participation in WSS and water pricing. Where water
pricing is proposed it is necessary to ensure that valuation and pricing should be negotiable between the
providers and users of water, through an open and transparent process. Government regulators must
have the capacity and ability to protect the public interest, whilst ensuring that investors and service pro-
viders are compensated for the services they provide. Pricing should be used as a mechanism to encour-
age conservation and curtailing wasteful use. The costs of water provision for the poor should be cov-
ered either by direct subsidies from governments or by rising block tariffs, so that the more affluent to
pay higher fees which can be ring fenced to pay for water provision for the poor.

  o **Private sector companies need to take steps to use water more efficiently**, and improve the quality of
water discharged by industry, through: raising awareness within the business community and encourag-
ing others to take action; disseminating more information about Eco-Efficiency and Cleaner Production
in general and specifically on fresh water use

  o **Removal of barriers that inhibit delivery of water services to the poor**. Through: Ensuring adequate
land tenure for the urban poor; Properly managed, trained and paid employees, including business sup-
port for employee education, training and provision of management skills to ensure people need to do
their jobs well; Moving toward more stable financial environments with effective legal systems to en-
courage private sector WSS investment
Towards Earth Summit 2002

5.6 Oceans and seas and Coastal zones

- **Further ratify and enforce the Law of the Sea**, including Migratory and Straddling Fish Stocks Agreement, as well other related oceans agreements. Flags of convenience need to be eliminated [7, 33]
- **Marine protected areas should be further extended** to the high seas and more key coastal and EEZ areas, creating marine migratory corridors [33]
- **Develop effective alternative measures for reducing the impact land based sources of marine pollution** e.g. dumping nuclear and toxic wastes, that have traditionally impacted coastal and marine resources e.g. fish stocks. Ensure transport of uranium and nuclear wastes across oceans and seas do not have detrimental impacts on natural environment and that the seas are not used as dumping grounds.
- **Greater investment and support for mechanisms that aim to monitor progress** and make policy recommendations e.g. GAP, Global Oceans Observation Systems (GOOS)

5.7 Hazardous wastes and chemicals

- **Develop a global regime of international law to harmonise the system of chemicals classification and labelling**, supported by training and education of workers and public groups, as well as the ratification of ILO Conventions e.g. concerning the safety in the use of Chemicals at work (no. 170) and the Convention concerning the prevention of major industrial accidents (no. 174), in Agriculture (no. 184) and Occupational health and safety (155) [33]
- **Reduce use of freshwater as a carrier of wastes** [14]
- **Develop effective alternative measures for dumping wastes** e.g. nuclear and toxic wastes, that have traditionally impacted natural ecosystems
- **Increase regulation in agriculture** (statutory and market based) to avoid of human and environmental costs of agrochemicals
- **Limit the transport of uranium and nuclear wastes** and ensure it doesn’t have detrimental impacts on natural environment and that the natural environment is not used as a dumping ground.
- **Develop legally binding instruments on civil liability** for transboundary damages caused by industrial accidents e.g. Impose charges for waste production [11]
- **Reduce waste and residential waste to land fill** through:
  - Household recycling programmes;
  - Diversion of solid waste to composting and materials recovery facilities;
  - Education and investment in awareness raising to reduce waste production
  - Improving the social and economic circumstances of waste workers

5.8 Forests and land

- **Establish forest and land ecosystem management that ensures environmental protection, economic viability and socially responsible practices.** Consolidate markets for non-timber forest products and environmental services which need to be properly valued and assessed [10, 33]
- **Assess the implicit risks of including plantations in the Clean Development Mechanism of the Kyoto Protocol.** [7]
- **The FAO should create a joint working group with civil society and government** to review its forestry definitions and policies, including developing standards for silviculture, soil protection, road building, privatisation of lands, public repatriation of land, recycling and reuse programmes, zoning of environmental, social and economic uses, education and training for sustainable practices in industry workers and public [10, 33]
- **Policy implementation to secure land rights for indigenous peoples**, including
  - The legal recognition of the rights of indigenous peoples to land,
Towards Earth Summit 2002

Stakeholder Views

- Maintenance of environmental integrity in their territories and protection of their customary activities,
- Ensuring their participation in forestry and land use, recognising traditional forest knowledge and traditional productive practices that contribute to biodiversity, through conservation and sustainable use
- Implementation of the ILO convention No. 169 Concerning indigenous and tribal peoples [31, 33]

- **Forest certification schemes** should be further enhanced and implemented to encourage better forestry management. Such as the use of community based forest management [31]
- **Where necessary techniques for forest fire prevention and recovery** need to be further developed [16]
- **Governments should adopt an ecosystems approach in agro-forestry policies** and promote the integrated land-use management instruments for land use, management and conservation of forests compatible with the wider ecosystem functions [10]
6. Health and Environment

The government regional meetings recognised the growing need for initiatives to strengthen health services should be seen as part of meeting the overall aims of poverty reduction and sustainable development (Integrated). They referred to the need for:

- **National action and international support** to strengthen health care facilities, with particular emphasis on major diseases, including the spread of HIV/AIDS, which place formidable challenges on the health sector (3.)
- **Integrated strategies for the improvement of health and the environment**, including the provision of safe drinking water, management of solid waste, reduction of risks associated with chemicals and other pollutants, as well as from the use of genetically modified organisms (5.)
- **Governments should significantly increase their emphasis on education and health care systems**, allocate additional resources and pay greater attention to meeting basic human needs in areas such as the provision of water supply and sanitation, shelter, food and nutrition (1.).

Stakeholders, gave a few specific reference to health and environment during the civil society meetings. Health and environment issues were referred to more in relation to other sustainability issues, such as in relation to poverty alleviation (Section 2.) and food security (Section 5.3). Participants particularly noted that it was crucial to recognise that environmental security, health and poverty are closely inter-related [11]. The more specific measures called for, included:

- **A reduction to the current level of malnutrition by 50%** (from the base year 2002) by the year 2012 [14]
- **Development of a clear position on the role of GMO’s** to feed critically undernourished areas and in development of medicines, through open and world-wide multi-stakeholder debate, to take account for GMO’s potential environmental and health effects, and ensuring that such technology would allow equitable access to resources [12]
- **A 50% increase in the number of people with access to basic health care services** in the poorest countries, and continued increase in access elsewhere [12]
- **To develop a unified position on the TRIPS agreement**, regarding the production on pharmaceuticals to treat certain major diseases, including HIV/AIDS, Malaria, TB. Ensuring greater recognition and incorporation of indigenous medicinal knowledge and rights, within TRIPs and related agreements [12, 13]
- **Ensuring free access to a minimum amount of water** - 50 litres per person per day from a source located within 1 km of user's dwelling – in accordance with the OECD target [10]
- **Establishment of government sponsored health insurance programmes**, to extend to poor and marginalized communities [13]
- **Industrialised countries to support greater transfer of technology and resources** to support research and development in health and medical care, through socially, ethically and environmentally sound practices in developing countries [13]
- **Government promotion of safer and healthier lifestyles and behaviour** through
  - Education, publicity campaigns, institutional strengthening and capacity building in health sector
  - Defining realistic environmental health and safety improvement goals, environmental management principles
  - Introducing policies and measures protect the public’s health based on well-defined, scientifically-based risk assessment principles [10, 13, 28]
- **National and corporate implementation of the ILO Conventions for Occupational health and safety in the workplace**, in partnership with public health authorities to ensure skilled and compassionate care of care workers especially in dealing with HIV/AIDS [33]
- **Promote compliance with and enforce environmental rules** in a non-discriminatory fashion, without creating obstacles to trade and market access [28]
- **Strengthen the linkages between the international activities on HIV/AIDS** through:
  - Encouraging governments to take decisions that favour young people who are particularly effected due to prevalence of drugs and alcohol abuse, unemployment, sex trade, etc
  - Increasing financial resources for HIV/AIDS, to be made available at a level which is appropriate to the gravity of the pandemic
Establish a multi-sectoral approach, including multi-stakeholder partnerships in the fight against the HIV/AIDS epidemic, including developing policies and implementation of agreements which aim to increase poverty alleviation, education, housing, food, water, shelter, access to essential medicine and health services.

Sexual and reproductive health services should apply the principle of voluntary and informed consent as a basic human right [22, 23, 26].
7. Finance for Sustainable development

[Regional meetings of government officials urged the international community, particularly developed countries, to allocate sufficient and predictable levels of new and additional financial resources to ensure effective implementation of Agenda 21. In particular they called for:

- The industrialised countries to meet the commitment to allocate 0.7% of their GNP as ODA
- Renewed consideration of mechanisms to relieve the burden of debt in highly-indebted developing countries
- Improved market access for developing countries’ products and the flow of Foreign Direct Investment to developing countries should be further encouraged
- The establishment of financial means to facilitating technology transfer and new sustainable approaches of production
- Additional and concessional funds for GEF and additional finance for facilitating the implementation of Multilateral Environmental Agreements. Make the process of resource allocation more transparent and efficient
- The International Conference on Financing for Development (March 2002) should address innovative and more effective mechanisms for financing the protection of national public goods that afford global benefits and propose means of linking the environmental dimension with countries fiscal policies.
- Greater regional and sub-regional cooperation could also significantly facilitate resource mobilization, e.g. Regional funds should be developed to facilitate finance targeted for sustainable development, as well as greater private and public involvement in regional initiatives(1.)

Stakeholders, from their meetings across the globe, called for setting Sustainable Development as a principle aim of operating guidelines for international, regional and national financial and economic bodies [14]. They called for strong action from governments, including:

- Extend reach of finance to all income groups, through use of mechanisms such as micro-credit, social banks and community funds, promotion of social responsibility of businesses and public toward schools, hospitals etc [12]
- Introduce full cost accounting, through payment and reinvestment of capital costs for resource depletion and waste generation, should be included in commercial and national accounts and used as indicators for decision-makers. National accounting rules should be adapted to incorporate the concept of natural resource accounting, including environmental risks [14, 30].
- Export credit agencies should implement policies that promote Sustainable action [14, 33]
- Banks, insurance companies and pension funds plus others should be encouraged to adopt policies and practice to encourage sustainability in investments [14]
- Take domestic responsibility to increase national savings from 17% GDP to 30%, encouraging household saving and expatriate return of finance; improve credit worthiness, present funding projects to international community that are environmentally sound and economically viable.
- Improve the infrastructure of national financial institutions, domestic markets and adopt appropriate laws and regulations and incentives for sustainable investment.
- Rationalise tax and subsidy systems and collection, towards sustainable ends [12]
- Reallocate budgets from military spending to poverty eradication and sustainable development. Aiming to reduce military expenditure by 25% as an initial step and redirect funds to social development - education and health, and environmental priorities [7, 12, 13]

Stakeholders recommended the following proposals on more specific financial areas.

7.1 New financial mechanisms and Innovative mechanisms

New mechanisms need to be clearly identified and implemented, including:

- The wider use of tradable permits to encourage efficient use of scarce resources
- Further introduction of international taxes to increase resources for sustainable development, including:
7.2 Improved debt cancellation and debt servicing.

Tackling debt will require:

- Greater access to sufficient and predictable financial resources for developing countries and economies in transition.
- Exchange of experiences in dealing with debt cancellation to assist future procedures [12]
- Review of the conditionality attached to debt financing, the effect of credit rating agencies and identify means to improve access to credit in future.
- Ensuring the 0.7% GNP for ODA target is met, with a reduction of “tied-aid” [7, 11, 30, 31, 33]
- Debt swaps for activities around sustainable development should be encouraged [30]
- Procurement regulations are renegotiated [7, 12]

7.3 Increased financial and resource support for the Global Environment Facility (GEF) and implementation of MEAs.

- Assessment of GEF is required to reformulate mechanisms to increase access to environmental finance [7]
- Strengthen the capacity of GEF so that its scope can be increased to cover further MEAs and their implementation, as well for GEF become further involved in other programmes e.g. development processes, finance and trade agreements
- A special emphasis should be placed on local capacity building and the financing of local sustainability agendas [10]

7.4 Achievement of the 0.7% of GNP for ODA target

Meeting the target of 0.7% GNP to ODA is urgently is required to supplement domestic and private efforts towards Sustainable Development. Recommendation include:

- The quality of programmes and projects for which ODA is used needs to be improved by more open, participatory policy formulation, impact assessments and capacity building, to encourage building of incentives for sustainable activities [7, 9, 10, 11, 30]
- Resource transfers of ODA to all spheres of government (including sub-national and local) [14]
- Establishing time-based bench marks and strategies towards reaching the ODA target

7.4 Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) increased in developing countries

Increasing the quality and quantity of FDI through:

- Creating an open, efficiently regulated, attractive domestic economic environment
- Standard assessment of FDI projects for their comparative advantages/disadvantages and contribution to Sustainable Development e.g. investment through mergers and acquisitions as opposed to “Greenfield” investment.
- International agencies, Financial Institutions, governments, industry, NGOs and civil society should work to ensure incentives for environmentally sound technology are on-hand for FDI projects and initiatives e.g. funding of pre-investment costs for sustainable technology, building joint ventures and “Build Operate Transfer” projects, grants.
7.5 Building export of goods and services from developing countries

Increasing developing country export markets will require:
- **Improved marketing techniques**, to enhance competitiveness on an international market.
- **Improved access to international markets**, through removal of trade barriers in industrialised countries e.g. domestic market subsidies.
- **Recognition that privatisation as a conditionality imposed by multinational financial and development institutions is not acceptable** [11]

7.6 Strengthening Global and regional development banks

Development institutions need to be strengthened to ensure finance is utilised for Sustainable Development, to build sustainably orientated national and regional economies [12]. **Strengthening and consolidation of multilateral financing mechanisms**, through:
- Further regulation of financial markets, controls on the movement of capital
- Building greater economic integration regional level.
- Improving the knowledge economy and access to technology
- New mechanisms to ensure that financial markets contribute to sustainable development, e.g. the Tobin tax or other global taxes.
- International regulation of foreign direct investment (FDI), to agree by the Summit that the UN will develop a framework convention on regulation of FDI [10, 12]
8. Technology transfer, capacity building and education

[During the regional meetings governments indicated concern that Agenda 21 commitments on technology transfer remained mostly been unfulfilled. They felt that the Summit should consider how to ensure that science, technology, and traditional knowledge are incorporated into decision-making for sustainable development at all levels. They called for:

- *The eradication of illiteracy* (6)
- Application of the *precautionary approach*, as set forth in the Rio Declaration and which underlies a number of relevant multilateral agreements, in decision-making for sustainable development (2.)
- *The international community to assist developing countries* (especially Africa) in their efforts to:
  - Gain access to New technologies
  - Create conditions for the better use and development of indigenous technologies
  - Build Capacity in scientific and academic research
  - Awareness raising about sustainability issues
- *The need to recognise the importance of capacity building at regional and sub-regional levels*, to:
  - to assist understanding in, and compliance with, regional and international instruments for sustainable development
- *Further promote transfer of sustainable technologies*, including through the WTO process and the continuing need to promote the development of local technologies (1.).]

Stakeholders, called for capacity building and technology transfer to enable better management of natural resources and strategic thinking about sustainable development at local to global levels. They called for governments to build self-sufficiency, and supporting people, across all ages, to help themselves and gain access to sustainable livelihoods and develop economic alternatives to unsustainable activities [10, 30]. Information, knowledge and capacity building play a central role in ensuring a fully informed and sustainable process, as well as to build commitment and leadership for sustainability [24, 30]

8.1 Common but differentiated responsibilities

- *Industrialised countries should establish programmes to assist poorer countries in their development of environmentally sound technology and promote social equity and working opportunities* [33]
- Encourage technological cooperation among private companies in production, R&D and marketing of technologies and products with reduced environmental impact [28]
- *Strengthen capacity in developing countries, including existing Science and Technology Capacity*, through:
  - Full and open exchange of scientific data and information for research and education, limiting additional costs for access
  - Enhanced education, discussion and dialogue for decision-makers on sustainable development [15, 30]

8.2 Education, training and learning

Up-grading the availability and quality of formal and informal education about sustainable development. To ensure it cuts across all disciplines including law, sciences, humanities, economics, sociology and engineering, not merely in environmental and life sciences, and in all types of education, as originally declared in Agenda 21 [18, 23, 26] through:

- *Integrating Sustainable Development into primary, secondary and tertiary education curriculum and teaching, including:*
  - Development sustainability strategies in education to coordinate and consolidate efforts, including indicators and monitor and assess progress in education systems
  - Curriculum related to sustainable development could be enhanced by “learning by doing” field projects
  - Teachers, students and administrators should works together to ensure learning through local, applied and active methods as a learning tools for sustainability. For youth-by-youth learning needs to be further
applied, including better recognition of non-formal education, closure cooperation between formal learning institutions which help link up young people.

- Education community should be established as the 10th major group recognised in Agenda 21, to recognise it a fundamental force for sustainable development [26, 30].

- Launching literacy campaigns
- Focusing on empowering people and strengthening of human and social capital, including the application of gender approaches to strategies for investing in people
- Provision of full, clear information, with equal access for all
- Promote sustainable lifestyles: Raise people's awareness through development of programmes in formal and non-formal education. To further incentivise actions through publicity campaigns and free flow of information. This might include training and education for workers to encourage new approaches of awareness raising and capacity building that provide carry over of behaviour patterns, where workers pursue sustainable action in other aspects of their lives[7, 30, 33]
- To use the Earth Charter as a means to raise public awareness about the values and issues [10, 12, 13, 24]
- Enhance mass media to spread information about sustainable development issues, particularly ideas for positive change from personal to international levels, utilising radio, television and the internet [26]
- Encourage businesses and labour unions to include sustainable development in their education and training programmes [26]
- Train women with political skills, local government representatives and administrators in gender analysis and planning. Develop toolkits to promote full participation of women in sustainable development activities [25]
- All people, especially young, require increased access to technology and the internet – as an important tool for communication, education and learning, through the establishment of a education and ICT Fund which promotes international cooperation, networking and partnerships of ICT learning centres [26]
- Increased priority should be given to build women’s participation in Science and technology, educating and employing women in education system, as this would significantly assist countries transition from a developing country toward a more sustainable path [26]
- Build up a critical mass of Science and technology capacity, including:
  - The creation of institutional networks, scientific exchanges and mobility
  - The establishment of scientific centres of excellence among nations with weak scientific infrastructures, including high quality universities, modern and well equipped research laboratories, independent research funding mechanisms and peer review mechanisms,
  - Building access to basic communication technologies [27].
- Increased domestic and international Investment in education and enabling technologies

8.3 Expanding research and knowledge

Scientific community must be constantly aware of and take responsibility for the potential impacts that research may have on sustainable development, promoting understanding of sciences, science education and literacy at all levels. In turn society must take responsibility to provide adequate resources, up-to-date research facilities and appropriate career structures, opportunities to inform and participate in the decision-making processes [27]

- Build collaborative international research centres dedicated to research and develop ideas addressing the world might make practical progress towards sustainability [26]
- Build exchanges of scientists and engineers in developing countries, including innovative programmes and policies to facilitate and support such exchanges [27]
- Promote revolution and creativity in thinking to seek out new ways of living. Examples of best practice and technological capacities strengthened in this area [23, 24]
- Academia should retain a degree of independence to ensure reliable and integrated research.
- Monitoring, establishment and use of indicators and integrated assessments all require greater international investment and support. In particular
  - to support global, regional and nationally linked observation structures e.g. IGOS, GOOS, GCOS, GTOS, as well as additional resources for developing integrated assessments of ecosystems [24, 27]
- Initiate a broad dialogue on Sustainable Development, to examine the dynamic interactions between na-
ture and society, e.g. through regional/ global symposium on science for Sustainable Development

- **Develop multi-disciplinary higher education courses and research to advance knowledge in young people and researchers about Sustainable Development and tools for implementation.** Including:
  - Establishment of funding schemes and scholarships to support interdisciplinary research, within academic institutions but also with public and private sectors [12, 13]

- **Create an enabling environment for stakeholder participation in decision-making, from local implementation to international negotiations.** Custodians of traditional knowledge have much to offer for Sustainable Development. Such knowledge needs to be better incorporated into academic research and public policy, to better represent the interests and Intellectual Property of indigenous people [13]

- **Enhance information access and stewardship, scientific innovation and technological development** targeted towards improving quality of life, better environmental management, increased consumer choice and greater social benefits [28]

8.4 Information and analysis

Many recognised that there is a significant need to more effectively communicate the necessity of sustainability. Recommendations includes:

- **Information, data management and indicators need to be enhanced as tools to aid decision-making.** needs to be:
  - Salient – to a particular problem
  - Clear – a core message with indicators
  - Credible – presenting a broadly supported and independently verifiable view
  - Constructive – offering alternative options, actions and solutions to assist recommendations
  - Legitimacy – supported and understood by wide stakeholder groups
  - Vision – take a long term perspective and early warning in advance of emerging issues

- **Enhanced analysis of emerging issues through:**
  - Increased access and coordination between science, technology and education
  - Encouraging multi-disciplinary academic studies,
  - Development of SMART (Specific, Measurable, Accurate, Relevant, Time-Bound) indicators for the assessment of progress in sustainable development [12, 13, 14]

- **Produce an Annual Independent Monitoring report on resources use and progress towards sustainability.** The report would bring together data from global economic, development, resource use, human rights and environmental agencies, to be presented in a form which is easy and clear to communicate to the general public and media [23]

- **Understanding the linkages between gender and sustainable development.** requires further analytical research should provide better insights and the increased collection and use of gender disaggregated data, quantitative and qualitative [22, 25]

- **Undertaking a systematic review of information dissemination and management frameworks.** With the aim to create a more comprehensive set of indicators than presently available from the CSD [26]

- **Two way decision-making (Top-down and bottom up).**

- **Improve the information available to young people and facilitate and support exchanges information by young people in different countries [30].** Including:
  - Encouraging the establishment of independent, democratic local and national youth councils, regional platforms, youth representatives in government delegations
  - **UN Youth Unit to act as a clearing house for information** for youth organisations and increase representation of youth in the UN by placements of youth representatives in UN institutions [26]
9. Governance and Participation

[Governments at the Regional meetings said that the Summit should discuss ways of improving institutional frameworks for sustainable development at national, regional and international levels. The highlighted that Good Governance, including human rights, rule of law, democracy and combating corruption, forms part of the foundation for sustainable development. They called for the Summit to]

- Recognise that peace and security are pre-requisites for sustainable development
- Initiate new efforts to improve partnerships with civil society, business and industry. Encouraging public participation in decision making at national, as well as regional and international levels
- To reach an agreement on an effective governance regime for sustainable development. To include the future role, mandate and programme of work of the United Nations Commission on Sustainable Development and the corresponding role of the UN Regional Commissions in the further implementation of Agenda 21.
- To achieve greater consistency and coordination among environmental, social and economic strategies and policies at international level through enhanced cooperation among the various entities of the UN system.
- To address whether making globalization work for sustainable development might require establishment of new governance institutions, or enhancement of the UN and its specialized agencies;
- To being to develop a more coherent and stronger regional institutional framework for sustainable development, in order to promote the integration of economic, social and environmental policies in the design and implementation of programmes and projects at the regional level. To further develop regional and sub-regional data transfer and databases, to assist decision making.
- Enable countries to take action on the early implementation of sustainable development policies and decision making-frameworks to integrate economic, social and environmental policies. Including:
  - The development and adoption, through participatory processes, indicator systems and targets for monitoring sustainable development.
  - Place a greater emphasis on decentralization of power and empowering local institutions,
  - Improved regulation of corruption, transparency and accountability
  - Institutionalize mechanisms for multi-stakeholder participation, with particular focus on the development of effective partnerships with business and industry and the science and technology community in finding solutions (1.)

At civil society events stakeholders said that Good Governance, national implementation and international cooperation are requisites for sustainable development. They felt was vital that institutions “re-focus” on the goal of sustainable development, and integrated pillars of environment, society and economics [29]. Whilst they recognised that ideas and proposals for reform have emerged they felt that political will for reform is lacking [28]. They called for Johannesburg Summit must take the lead in democratising governance structures, including:

9.1 Putting principles into practice

The importance of transparency, accountability, inclusiveness and participation, needs to be promoted in governance frameworks, to assist community empowerment, further recognise women’s issues, and make progress poverty alleviation and inequity, as well as environmental integrity [24].

- Integration and harmonisation
  - Break down the fragmentation and compartmentalisation of policy making and programme delivery, through greater coordination and cooperation within and between governments for sustainable development
  - Flexible boundaries and horizontal communication should be established between organisations, across multi-stakeholder groupings to create multi-skilled teams
  - Need to harmonise development policy with international instruments, such as MEAs, ILO conventions, the outcomes of International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights to observe and respect human and collective rights as proscribed in international law. As well as building on the outcomes of previous UN conferences and 5 year reviews, Human Rights Conference (Vienna), ICPD (Cairo), Womens’ Conference (Beijing), Social Summit (Copenhagen), Habitat (Istanbul) [17,18, 23, 24]
• **Decentralisation and devolution of power.** To further apply the subsidiarity principle, Governments and multinational bodies need to:
  
  o Significantly increase the delegation of power, resources and responsibility to the local level, including the involvement of civil society. The role of the centre should be to create conditions where local action is encouraged, promote good practice and key principles for sustainability, rather than to operate through excessive control and regulation.
  
  o Reduce barriers to decentralised cooperation through greater recognition that the local level must be incorporated into planning and policy making initiative. This includes supporting direct engagement of local and sub-national institutions into national processes, such as National Councils for Sustainable Development and international processes e.g. CSD. [23,24]
  
  o Promote participatory democracies and regimes conducive to multi-stakeholder and popular participation

• **Equity and justice,** we all need to work toward long term resolution of conflicts and establishing a culture of peace, through activities such as:
  
  o Adoption of policies to eliminate corruption and build greater transparency and accountability in government affairs, through national legislation corresponding with the Anti-Corruption Convention;
  
  o Integrate environmental, human rights principles and anti-discrimination conventions, including: Elimination of Racial Discrimination (1966); Rights of a child (1987 and optional protocol, 2000); Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (1979, and optional protocol, 1999); Protection of rights of migrant workers and their families (1990). To reflect these conventions clearly into official sustainable development policies (environment, economic and social);
  
  o NGOs, the private sector and other bodies also need to adopt this approach mainstreaming the principles into planning and programmes, evaluation, decision-making from local to global levels [7, 25]

9.2 The Local and National level

Governments need to take strong leadership role towards sustainable development across their ministries. Governments need take the lead in redefining themselves at all levels, toward becoming federated democratic and cooperative institutions, involving all stakeholders equitably and taking into account their conflicting views to meet sustainable objectives. Such institutions should address conflicting interests and needs [23]:

• **Setting up specific institutional arrangements involving a cross section of society and greater integration between different tiers of government** to ensure coordinated action, participation and partnerships, including:
  
  o Introducing national accounting systems to aid decision making on national policy
  
  o Adopting and building upon local Agenda 21s, and NSSDs and plans of action, including specific targets, financial commitments and human resources with a body to monitor and regulate progress
  
  o Establish national and local councils for sustainable development to manage the development and progress of a country’s NSSD, including multi-stakeholder representation
  
  o Establish Multi-stakeholder dialogues and public participation in Sustainable Development, better accountability practices by stakeholders and involvement in implementation of commitments in local community groups and national Councils. Also to encourage greater use of institutional partnerships e.g. business and local authorities, indigenous people, trade unions, women, NGOs
  
  o Undertake sustainability assessments to take place prior, during and after policies and programmes, and to apply the Rio Principles across all levels of decision making
  
  o Develop and share workable and practical models for Sustainable Development on how to integrate issues from local and national levels, in consultation with different stakeholders [7, 12, 13, 30]

• **Good governance also means adequate implementation of environmental and social law, the eradication of corruption in government,** the public and private sector, and decisive action against environmental and social crime. This will include the ratification and enforcement of conventions in national legislation which support sustainable development, including the MEAs, Human Rights and the ILO Conventions ([12, 13, 30].

• **Further decentralisation and transfer state resources to the municipalities to empower local communities** and strengthen local institutions to take Sustainable Development decisions

• **Provide adequate infrastructure and social services to create an enabling environment for people, civil society and private sector, encouraging their participation in sustainable development at local to national levels** [7]
- Set Sustainable Development at the core of education and learning across age groups, and in both formal and informal learning. And develop alternatives strategies to engage the young in formulation of policies and strategies.
- **Supporting new initiatives in the workplace** e.g. green agreements between employers, trade unions and employees, workplace health and safety and wider environmental concerns included.
- **Industrialised countries should take greater responsibility for developing countries**, aiding them in their progress towards Sustainable Development and implementing CSD recommendations.
- **Strengthen local government** through enhancing the legitimacy of local governance structures, increasing their authority and access to resources, as well as greater integration of local policies and development plans into national processes.
  - Local authorities should integrate LA21 planning activities formerly into annual budgeting and statutory planning activities [24]
- **Resolve jurisdictional conflicts and compartmentalisation of government.**
  - Intra-governmental cooperation is needed to reallocate authority and resources to other spheres of government.
  - Traditional departments and utilities should be redesigned to increase coordination and given principle rewards for achieving equity and sustainability targets
  - Need to reinforce rural – urban linkages [24]
- **Reduce short termism.** Avoid over-short electoral terms to encourage longer-term political thinking and planning, even when the benefits will not be seen in the lifetime of a particular governing party. This should also include expanding the duration and breadth of sustainability projects towards more lasting and mainstream programmes, which enable the space for improvement from a range of groups [24]

### 9.3 The Regional level

- **Establish Regional Councils for Sustainable Development, involving civil society and regional bodies**, including UNEP offices, Economic Commissions, Development Banks and other multi-lateral bodies, as well as NCSDs to build regional integration and cooperation around transboundary resources, climate change, illegal trade, sustainable and efficient economic and financial systems, informational flow and technology sharing. Including consideration of adapting the Regional Economic Commissions to become UN inter-governmental Commissions for Sustainable Development to improve regional integration. [11, 30]
- **Develop regional trust funds for regional CSDs**, ensuring that funds are fully transparent and involve wide range of stakeholders to promote Implementation on Agenda 21
- **Stronger regional environment bodies**, with greater resources and interaction with other regional grouping e.g. the Economic Commissions, regional trade block, regional development banks, as well as encouraging stakeholder involvement [30]
- **Strengthen and establish regional treaties** to increase regional regulation for:
  - protecting natural resources, establishing food security mechanisms, increase micro-credit and finance schemes more widely implemented
  - Implementation of existing agreements e.g. Aarhus Convention on the Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters
- **Foster dialogue between different stakeholders through the formation of coalitions and networks**, particularly of southern groups and countries to define policy proposals and obtain increased influence in international negotiations and help monitor and evaluate actions [7, 12,13]

### 9.4 The Global level

Establish a process towards greater democracy in global decision-making processes and international agencies [7], through:

- **Increasing the strength and overarching role of the UN CSD to more effectively require integrated institutional action on CSD negotiated recommendations.** Recommendations include:
  - Increased financial resources, monitoring resource flows and technology transfer for sustainable development, and authority to take actions to remove roadblocks though and being given a higher status in ECOSOC

---

Towards Earth Summit 2002 Stakeholder Views

---

43
Towards Earth Summit 2002

Stakeholder Views

- Cross-departmental ministerial representation in CSD from government delegations
- Greater emphasis on regional actions and review regional achievements
- Greater jurisdiction to ensure implementation of the outcomes of WSSD
- Consider the establishment of a UN Trusteeship Council for Sustainable Development
- Encourage interactions between economic, environmental and social institutions and policies for improved implementation, and to establish enabling conditions for sustainable development. [12, 13, 28]

**Reforming and Strengthening the UN Environment Programme**, including:
- Enhancement to the status of a UN Agency;
- Allocation of a stronger coordinatory mandate over the MEAs and other UN bodies and multi-lateral bodies with activities which relate to the environmental arena;
- Increase levels of government and multi-lateral funding to support this environment arm of the UN
- Establish clear mechanisms to increase the level of transparency, information flow and participation from multiple stakeholders from local to global levels [11, 30]

- **The UN process, mandated during the Millennium Summit, to start a process of reform of the global economic institutions** (IMF, World Bank and WTO and multilateral development bodies and banks) needs to be strengthened to establish democratic mechanisms for:
  - Putting Sustainable Development in to the operating the guidelines of IFIs, regional development and economic bodies
  - Participation of WTO, WB and IMF in meeting the aims of tackling poverty and building sustainable production and consumption
  - Integrated assessments of impacts of policies prior to trade and investment negotiations to ensure social justice, environmental sustainability and benefits for all;
  - Establish equal rights and special facilities to enable developing countries to effectively engage within their decision-making processes
  - The establishment of a globally elected assembly within the UN framework to hold account the principles world institutions, including WTO, IMF and World Bank
  - Formation of a global Economic Commission or an enhanced ECOSOC to play a stronger international role, equivalent to the regulatory bodes of advanced economies
  - Reform of WTO, WB, IMF should be based on appropriate principles for sustainable development and democratic governance
  - Rationlise the UN development and aid bodies under the leadership of the UNDP, through a strengthened UN Development Group [7, 8, 9, 12, 23, 26, 30]

- **Building greater global environmental authority**, including:
  - UNEP should be strengthened, with greater and regular financial contributions from member governments, with consideration of:
  - To address a longer term vision of becoming a World Environment Organisation
  - To provide, among other things an umbrella for the many MEAS, improving their harmonisation and implementation.
  - Increasing the interaction of UN and multi-lateral bodies working on the environment through an enhanced role in a strengthened Environment Management Group
  - New frameworks for International Environmental Governance, coming out of Earth Summit 2002 should use mechanisms to build public access to information and participation to make the process of environmental governance more accessible and meaningful to the public [22]

- **All institutions need to improve the capacity, transparency, accountability and participation within international decision-making**, in international agreements, summits and general meetings, notably within events and processes organised by WTO, IMF, WEF, G8, EU Council, amongst other processes [7].

### 9.5 Participation and partnership

Major groups play significant roles in investigating, monitoring, exposing, educating, implementing, making linkages with global and local levels. Governments and institutions cannot hope to achieve sustainability without the active and willing participation of their citizens and trust that governments are acting their best interest. All spheres of government need to develop solidarity and cooperation with a range of groups [7]. They need to:
• Fully implement Principle 10 of the Rio Declaration for Providing access to information, participation and access to justice in environmental matters, in all countries. Also build access to information on corporations and public agencies [7, 30].

• **Build a sense of citizenship** in all major groups to work in partnership with the state, public and private bodies to rebuild local institutions and resources and ensure they have the power to fulfill their mandates [24].

• **Establish a template for evaluation**, as well as transparency and accountability. For example to ensure that business is recognised beyond multi-nationals, to include better representation of small to medium business, farmers, entrepreneurs perspectives [7, 18].

• **Strengthen mechanisms for civil society to participate in Sustainable development at all levels of governance** through further development Multi-Stakeholder Processes and conflict resolution mechanisms, including:
  - **Further engaging strategic partnerships** which bring diverse perspective and ideas to the table.
  - **Improve the democratic deficit**, with the inclusion of NGOs, faith communities, artists, women, youth, indigenous peoples, local authorities, business, academic community, trade unions etc, bringing a stronger link between stakeholder processes and ‘official’ meetings.
  - **Establish agreed mechanisms for participation global negotiations** for civil society, throughout the UN and other multilateral institutions to help drive forward global sustainable development policy, giving adequate timing, resources, access to necessary information to allow preparation for effective participation.
  - **Ensuring all stakeholders are empowered** to take decisions and participate in political processes about sustainable development, creating a level playing field through funding, building capacity, information flow, openness and allowing the space to forge real partnerships, as well as the establishment of educational materials and training activities, particularly to empower support typically marginalised groups to participate [7, 20, 22, 23, 24, 25, 28, 31].

• **Build public awareness and participation**, including establishing:
  - Public interest media channels, both on television an internet, to present and foster equitable and sustainable human development.

• **Supporting young people** in their endeavours to obtain resources for extensive and comprehensive youth empowerment programmes [26].

• **Trade Unions and workers to take a direct role in the changing the workplace**, in support of social dialogues and promotion of the ILO Core labour Standards that inherently support sustainable practices.

• **Promote gender equity and empowerment** – “to combat poverty, hunger and disease and stimulate sustainable development”, mainstreaming gender issues across policies and institutions, including gender analysis in all policies and plans as a prerequisite for sustainable development [7, 25].

• **Indigenous peoples to be given the space to ensure a better reflection and learning from other groups of their knowledge, rights and contribution to sustainable development.**

• **The scientific has responsibility to inform and participate in decision-making processes** in order to increase the impact of science for building effective governance frameworks for sustainable development [27].

• **Business commitment**. The business and industry sector, as a part of domestic and global societies plays a significant role in sustainable development. Over the next century, business and industry needs to provide source of innovation, marketing of sustainability and sustainable choices, and global distribution of new technologies to further help this process [28].

Acknowledgements. This paper was produced as part of Stakeholder Forum’s “Towards Earth Summit 2002” project, with the support of members of our International Advisory Board.
10. Global Deal

“Johannesburg should result in a concrete programme of action with time-bound measures and well specified sources of funding to implement them, a clear follow up mechanism to ensure that this programme is able to make a real difference in lives of people who look to the summit for a better life”

The idea of a Global Deal was welcomed by some groups, but it was recommended that it involved clear commitments and concrete actions leading to poverty eradication, sustainable production and consumption patterns as well as improvement of governance and democratic processes at all levels [30]. All governments and civil society to need affirm their commitment for a new partnership for sustainable development. The expectation from South Africa, quoted above, shows that we have to act, and act together, not just keep repeating the right words. Johannesburg will require a response from all the peoples of the world to ensure that our planet remains hospitable to our existence. It could provide a real opportunity to allow good practice to be duplicated, mainstreamed and widely implemented [7].

The Global Deal should be formulated in a clear and open process to further the prospects for genuine partnership, in the run up to and during Johannesburg, to help define:

- What are the aims and objectives of the global deal?
- How will programmes of delivery be established, regulated, implemented, funded, resourced?
- Who will take the lead, who will participate more generally and how will they be facilitated in an equitable and open manner?
- How will the processes be monitored, assessed and reviewed?

A number of groups felt that a new Global Deal for sustainable development should be based on a foundation of clear principles, including:

- **Equity** – eradicating poverty through equitable and sustainable access to resources;

- **Rights** – securing environmental and social rights;

- **Limits** – reducing resource use to within sustainable limits;

- **Justice** – recognition of ecological debts and cancellation of financial debts;

- **Democracy** – ensuring access to information and public participation; and

- **Ethics** – rethinking the values and principles that guide human behaviour."
Regional Government Meetings

1. Integrated assessment (by Summit Secretariat)
2. Europe and North America
3. Africa
4. Latin America and Caribbean
5. Arabic states
6. Asia

Stakeholder Processes

10. Thematic Working Groups from the Río+8 document 'We Have One Earth' 2000
11. UN Economic Commission for Europe’s Multi-stakeholder dialogues (Geneva, September 2001)
12. Round table (Africa, Cairo June 2001)
13. Roundtable East Asia and Pacific, (Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia July 2001)
14. Round table Europe and North America, Colorado 6-8 June 2001
15. Address by International Scientific and Technological Community as a major group (New York 30th April 2001, 10th session of CSD, WSSD Prep Comm 1.)
16. Address by Business and Industry as a major group (New York 30th April 2001, 10th session of CSD, WSSD Prep Comm 1.)
17. Address by Women as a major group (New York 30th April 2001, 10th session of CSD, WSSD Prep Comm 1.)
18. Address by youth as a major group (New York 30th April 2001, 10th session of CSD, WSSD Prep Comm 1.)
19. Address by farmers as a major group (New York 30th April 2001, 10th session of CSD, WSSD Prep Comm 1.)

Acknowledgements. This paper was produced as part of Stakeholder Forum's "Towards Earth Summit 2002" project. It was produced with the support and input of members of our International Advisory Board.